

# **ADVENTISM'S NEW VIEW**

*'It's Beyond Belief'*

**JEFF PIPPENGER**

Table of Contents

Preface

Introduction

1. 1888 Distorted
2. Gospel Conditions
3. Righteousness by Faith
4. The Scope of the Gospel
5. Jones, Waggoner, and 1888
6. The New View
7. Two Phases of Justification
8. Universal Language
9. The "In Christ" Motif
10. AT. Jones and the "In Christ" Motif
11. E.J. Waggoner and the New View
12. The Second Death
13. Beyond Belief
14. Other Problems
15. Appendix

## **Preface**

In the late 70s and early 80s Desmond Ford jarred some Seventh-day Adventists awake with teachings new to Adventism, teachings which he claimed were the true gospel. We now refer to his teachings as the New Theology, but they were actually old theology in a new dress. The apostle John met this heresy in his era as evidenced in the messages Christ gave John for the churches in Ephesus and Pergamos. See Revelation 2:5, 15.

Christ speaks of the church over which Satan presides [Pergamos] as the synagogue of Satan. Its members are the children of disobedience. They are those who choose to sin, who labor to make void the holy law of God. It is Satan's work to mingle evil with good, thus removing the distinction between good and evil. Christ would have the church that labors to separate the evil from the good, whose members will not willingly tolerate wrongdoing, but will expel it from the heart and life. The Seventh-day Adventist Bible Commentary, vol. 7, 958.

Our prophet Ellen White also met this counterfeit gospel in her day:

*The doctrine is now largely taught that the gospel of Christ has made the law of God of no effect; that by 'believing' we are released from the necessity of being doers of the Word. But this is the doctrine of the Nicolaitans, which Christ so unsparingly condemned. Ibid., 957.*

*Is it [our sin] the sin of the Nicolaitans, turning the grace of God into lasciviousness? Ibid.*

At Glacier View, in the early 80s, the church was forced to deal with Ford's counterfeit gospel and he was defrocked. But now we have reached the 90s and an even greater theological crisis has appeared. Every wind of doctrine seems to be blowing within Adventism.

*Now the Spirit speaketh expressly, that in the latter times some shall depart from the faith, giving heed to seducing spirits, and doctrines of devils; speaking lies in hypocrisy; having their conscience seared with a hot iron. 1 Timothy 4:1-2.*

Today we have the futurists who are attempting to reapply the prophecies of Daniel and the Revelation, discounting the Spirit-of Prophecy statement that new light will not contradict old light. We also find in many places the same teachings for which Ford was defrocked being preached in the pulpits, and very few objections are made. When the straight testimony is given in response, it is considered critical, and some have been censored and even disfellowshipped for promoting it.

Jack Sequeira, who promotes these Nicolaitan concepts, is now sponsored by some leaders to teach what is purportedly the 1888 message of righteousness by faith. In reality his is a new version of the 'New Theology'. Desmond Ford was easy to identify. At Pacific Union College he openly renounced his belief in the investigative judgment. There was an immediate response from some laymen, pastors and leaders. The outcome of that episode is now history.

Jack Sequeira is much more subtle. Proclaiming what he calls, "the essence of the 1888 message," he insidiously contradicts it with carefully chosen words and phrases. His book *Beyond Belief* is just one of a series of dangerous books that have recently come from our denominational presses. The following chapters will clearly identify and deal with some of the erroneous and dangerous teachings contained in this book.

Justification and sanctification are one doctrine; you cannot separate the two. When one is justified he is sanctified. This experience produces righteousness, which is good works. Sanctification is the work of the Holy Spirit holding the willing supplicant in the relationship of justification. See *Selected Messages*, book 1, 397, 366; *Testimonies*, vol. 2, 355, 505.

The law of God can be kept perfectly by man in the same way Jesus kept it, by the Holy Spirit's power, when we are willing to be made willing to merge our will with God's in a continuous relationship of obedience to the truth. See *The Faith I Live By*, 114.

At the cross, God provided probationary grace, giving the human family an opportunity for a second probation. But the human family as a whole was not justified by Christ's sacrifice. To justify is a judicial act; however, it must also reflect the heart condition of the repentant sinner. Repentance will be manifested by obedience to all of God's known will. Such obedience is made possible when we unite our will with God's will. Doing His will results in our being clothed with the garment of Christ's

righteousness.

*By His perfect obedience He has made it possible for every human being to obey God's commandments. When we submit ourselves to Christ, the heart is united with His heart, the will is merged in His will, the mind becomes one with His mind, the thoughts are brought into captivity to Him; we live His life. This is what it means to be clothed with the garment of His righteousness. Christ's Object Lessons, 312.*

In the new birth the heart is brought into harmony with God, as it is brought into accord with His law. When this mighty change has taken place in the sinner, he has passed from death unto life, from sin unto holiness, from transgression and rebellion to obedience and loyalty.

Erroneous theories of sanctification springing from neglect or rejection of the divine law, have a prominent place in the religious movements of the day. These theories are both false in doctrine and dangerous in practical results; and the fact that they are so generally finding favor, renders it doubly essential that all have a clear understanding of what the Scriptures teach upon this point.

*True sanctification is a Bible doctrine. The apostle Paul, in his letter to the Thessalonian church, declares: "This is the will of God, even your sanctification." 1 Thessalonians 4:3. And he prays: "The very God of peace sanctify you wholly." 1 Thessalonians 5:23. The Bible clearly teaches what sanctification is and how it is to be attained. The Saviour prayed for His disciples: "Sanctify them through thy truth: thy word is truth." John 17:17. And Paul teaches that believers are to be "sanctified by the Holy Ghost." Romans 15:16. What is the work of the Holy Spirit? Jesus told His disciples: "When he, the Spirit of truth, is come, he will guide you into all truth." John 16:13. And the psalmist says: "Thy law is the truth." By the Word and the Spirit of God are opened to men the great principles of righteousness embodied in His law. And since the law of God is "holy, and just, and good," a transcript of 'the divine perfection, it follows that a character formed by obedience to that law will be holy. Christ is a perfect example of such a character. He says: "I have kept my Father's commandments." "I do always those things that please him." John 15:10; 8:29. The followers of Christ are to become like Him by the grace of God to form characters in harmony with the principles of His holy law. This is Bible sanctification. This work can be accomplished only through faith in Christ, by the power of the indwelling Spirit of God. The Great Controversy, 468-469.*

The Editors

## **Introduction**

By Ron Spear

In the creation of this world God created man in His own image. See The Story of Redemption, 20-41. He endowed man with the freedom of choice, otherwise they would have been robots. Had man been created as a robot, sin could never have entered, for sin results from a decision. The angels could have prevented Eve from eating the forbidden fruit, but God's love demanded the freedom of choice. To display His love required giving Adam and Eve the freedom not only to obey, but also disobey.

Disobedience to God's law brought rebellion and war to the heavenly courts, and God was forced to defend His law, His character, and His truth. God's truth had to be displayed against Satan's errors. Righteousness confronted unrighteousness. Satan's error brought rebellion, division, and war. So it has been since the great controversy began, and so it has been for 6000 years on Planet Earth. The righteous law of God has

been in existence from eternity. It is this law that identifies sin. See 1 John 3:4; Romans 5: 13; The Great Controversy, 493; Testimonies, vol. 8, 312; God's Amazing Grace, 40.

When Adam and Eve broke the law they became sinners with the condemnation of death. Instantly Jesus stepped between the sinner and the penalty of the broken law. The Creator became the Recreator, the Redeemer of the fallen race. A probationary period was granted to the fallen race, that every man might choose to accept the provisions of the gospel. Freedom of choice is still a central issue in the controversy, and man must choose between eternal life or eternal death. To secure this probationary period Christ takes fallen mans place that we may have a choice to be treated as He deserves.

*Christ was treated as we deserve, that we might be treated as He deserves. He was condemned for our sins, in which He had no share, that we might be justified by His righteousness, in which we had no share. He suffered the death which was ours, that we might receive the life which was His. "With His stripes we are healed." The Desire of Ages, 25.*

To believe and teach that God justified the whole human race at Calvary without their consent stands opposed to the very principle of the freedom of choice. If Adam and Eve were justified immediately after the Fall without their consent, then would their children have been sinners? And did they need to be kept from the tree of life?

God allowed this 6000 years of the great controversy because the freedom of choice is essential in demonstrating the character of God. The character of God does not annul His justice and He clearly teaches that the penalty of sin is death. The penalty for transgression of the law of God is as immutable as His protection of the freedom of choice.

Because the Creator is the only one who can redeem sinners, Christ Jesus offers to take the penalty that rightly belonged to our first parents. Not only does He bear the penalty, He also came all the way down to the sinner's level after 4000 years of sin had decimated the human race. See The Desire of Ages, 49, 112, 117. He submitted to become an embryo in the womb of Mary, to suffer poverty, to know hunger and thirst, to be persecuted, to be tempted in all points, and to die the death of a criminal at the hands of the church He loved. What love, what matchless love!

*For God so loved the world, that he gave his only begotten Son, that whosoever believeth in him should not perish, but have everlasting life. John 3:16.*

*Christ came to the world to counteract Satan's falsehood that God had made a law which men could not keep. Taking humanity upon Himself, He came to this earth, and by a life of obedience showed that God has not made a law that man cannot keep. He showed that it is possible for man perfectly to obey the law. Those who accept Christ as their Saviour, becoming partakers of His divine nature, are enabled to follow His example, living in obedience to every precept of the law. Through the merits of Christ, man is to show by his obedience that he could be trusted in heaven, that he would not rebel. That I May Know Him, 114.*

By His perfect obedience to His righteous law He has set us an example of perfect law keeping. In setting this example He used no power that is not available for man to use. See The Desire of Ages, 664. If we choose to receive the provisions of the gospel we have access to the same power Christ used for obedience, but if we choose not to accept the provisions offered, we receive the penalty for our sins. By accepting the provisions of the gospel we receive the Holy Spirit, and sanctification begins at the very

moment that we are justified.

By constantly choosing to retain the indwelling Holy Spirit we are held in the experience of justification and sanctification. By the power of the indwelling Holy Spirit the repentant sinner continues to develop the character of Christ, from grace to grace, and from glory to glory.

Our character is the only thing any of us will take to the next world.

*The Lord has a great work to be done, and He will bequeath the most in the future life to those who do the most faithful, willing service in the present life. The Lord chooses His own agents, and each day, under different circumstances, He gives them a trial in His plan of operation. In each true-hearted endeavor to work out His plan, He chooses His agents not because they are perfect but because, through a connection with Him, they may gain perfection.*

*God will accept only those who are determined to aim high. He places every human agent under obligation to do his best. Moral perfection is required of all. Never should we lower the standard of righteousness in order to accommodate inherited or cultivated tendencies to wrong-doing. We need to understand that imperfection of character is sin. All righteous attributes of character dwell in God as a perfect, harmonious whole, and every one who receives Christ as a personal Saviour is privileged to possess these attributes. . . .*

*Of every Christian the Lord requires growth in efficiency and capability in every line. Christ has paid us our wages, even His own blood and suffering, to secure our willing service. He came to our world to give us an example of how we should work, and what spirit we should bring into our labor. He desires us to study how we can best advance His work and glorify His name in the world, crowning with honor, with the greatest love and devotion, the Father who "so loved the world, that He gave His only begotten Son, that whosoever believeth in Him should not perish, but have everlasting life." John 3: 16.*

*But Christ has given us no assurance that to attain perfection of character is an easy matter. A noble, all-round character is not inherited. It does not come to us by accident. A noble character is earned by individual effort through the merits and grace of Christ. God gives the talents, the powers of the mind; we form the character. It is formed by hard, stem battles with self. Conflict after conflict must be waged against hereditary tendencies. We shall have to criticize ourselves closely, and allow not one unfavorable trait to remain uncorrected.*

*Let no one say, I cannot remedy my defects of character. If you come to this decision, you will certainly fail of obtaining everlasting life. The impossibility lies in your own will. If you will not, then you can not overcome. The real difficulty arises from the corruption of an unsanctified heart, and an unwillingness to submit to the control of God.*

*Remember that you will never reach a higher standard than you yourself set. Then set your mark high, and step by step, even though it be by painful effort, by self-denial and sacrifice, ascend the whole length of the ladder of progress. Let nothing hinder you. . . .*

*A character formed according to the divine likeness is the only treasure that we can take from this world to the next. . . .*

*The heavenly intelligences will work with the human agent who seeks with determined faith that perfection of character which will reach out to perfection in action.*

*To everyone engaged in this work Christ says, I am at your right hand to help you.*

*As the will of man co-operates with the will of God, it becomes omnipotent. Whatever is to be done at His command may be accomplished in His strength. All His biddings are enablings. Christ's Object Lessons, 330-333.*

Yes, justification and sanctification are obtained by faith, and are the third angel's message in verity. See Evangelism, 190, 196. The experience of justification and sanctification in the lives of His church will make a demonstration to the world of what God can do through fallen human beings when they choose to obey.

To say that God justified (made righteous) the whole world at Calvary is to contradict His very words,

*Jesus answered and said unto him, Verily, verily, I say unto thee, Except a man be born again, he cannot see the kingdom of God. John 3:3.*

## **Chapter 1- 1888 Distorted**

The publishing of the book Beyond Belief by Jack Sequeira has brought about a chain of circumstances necessitating the formulation of the following book.

This book will first briefly describe the gospel plan as set forth in the Scriptures and echoed in the Spirit of Prophecy. We will address a few aspects of the gospel, then set forth the gospel message as brought by AT. Jones and EJ. Waggoner. We will then identify some of the concerns we find in the book Beyond Belief It matters not what any man or group of men believes to be truth. It does matter what we individually believe. It is our prayer that individually God's people will come to the true understanding of the plan of salvation, and then experience and proclaim it.

*We must know individually the prescribed conditions of entering into eternal life. . . . We cannot allow these questions to be settled for us by another's mind, or another's judgment. We must search the Scriptures carefully with a heart open to the reception of light and the evidences of truth. We cannot trust the salvation of our souls to ministers, to idle traditions, to human authorities, or to pretensions. We must know for ourselves what God has said. . . . It is not to be our study as to what may be the opinion of men, or of popular faith, or what the Fathers have said. We cannot trust to the voice of the multitude, but we want to know what is the voice of God, what is His revealed will. . . . The Lord positively demands of every Christian an intelligent knowledge of the Scriptures. Review and Herald, March 8, 1887.*

## **Purpose of the Gospel**

*By sin the image of God in man has been marred and well-nigh obliterated; it is the work of the gospel to restore that which has been lost; and we are to co-operate with the divine agency in this work. And how can we come into harmony with God, how shall we receive His likeness, unless we obtain a knowledge of Him? It is this knowledge that Christ came into the world to reveal unto us. Testimonies, vol. 5, 743.*

*The true object of education is to restore the image of God in the soul. In the beginning, God created man in His own likeness. He endowed him with noble qualities. His mind was well balanced, and all the powers of his being were harmonious. But the Fall and its effects have perverted these gifts. Sin has marred and well-nigh obliterated*

*the image of God in man, It was to restore this that the plan of salvation was devised, and a life of probation granted man, To bring him back to the perfection in which he was first created, is the great object of life—the object that underlies every other. Patriarchs and Prophets, 595.*

*There is a science of Christianity to be mastered,—a science much deeper, broader, higher than any human science as the heavens are higher than the earth. The mind is to be disciplined, educated, trained; for we are to do service for God in ways that are not in harmony with inborn inclination. Hereditary and cultivated tendencies to evil must be overcome. Often the education and training of a lifetime must be discarded, that one may become a learner in the school of Christ. Our hearts must be educated to become steadfast in God. We are to form habits of thought that will enable us to resist temptation. The Ministry of Healing, 453-454.*

The purpose of the gospel is to reproduce God's character in fallen man.

## **Chapter 2- Gospel Conditions**

Except for brief connecting words and a few comments, the following remarks are all quotations taken from the Spirit of Prophecy: There are rules given in the gospel (see Testimonies to Ministers, 192-193). Indeed, the gospel sets before us a high standard (see Testimonies vol. 5, 87-88). We are not only “to appreciate” (Review and Herald, December 18, 1886), and “give attention to the claims of the gospel” (Christ's Object Lessons, 224), but to “submit to the gospel requirements.” Testimonies, vol. 6, 96.

*Strive to enter in at the strait gate: for many, I say unto you, will seek to enter in, and shall not be able. Luke 13:24.*

### **Repentance**

“Repent ye, and believe the gospel.” Mark 1:15. Repentance is associated with faith, and is urged in the gospel as essential to salvation, See Review and Herald, November 4, 1990. In 1828, Noah Webster defined essential: 2. First or constituent principles; as essentials of religion. 3. The chief point; that which is most important.

*There is no salvation without repentance. No impenitent sinner can believe with his heart unto righteousness. Repentance is described by Paul as a godly sorrow for sin, that “worketh repentance to salvation not to be repented of”, 2 Corinthians 7: 10. This repentance has in it nothing of the nature of merit, but it prepares the heart for acceptance of Christ as the only Saviour, the only hope of the lost sinner. Selected Messages, book 1, 365. See *ibid*” 353.*

*The gospel of Christ requires penitence for sin. See Review and Herald, September 3, 1901. Repentance has been deemed as “a radical change of mind and spirit and action.” *Ibid.*, book 1, 393.*

### **Obedience**

*Not every one that saith unto me, Lord, Lord, shall enter into the kingdom of heaven; but he that doeth the will of my Father which is in heaven. Matthew 7:21.*

*Go . . . . and teach all nations teaching them to observe all things whatsoever I*

*have commanded you. Matthew 28:19-20. And when he had called the people unto him with his disciples also, he said unto them, Whosoever will come after me, let him deny himself, and take up his cross, and follow me. For whosoever will save his life shall lose it; but whosoever shall lose his life for my sake and the gospel's, the same shall save it. Mark 8:34-35.*

*But he must co-operate with divine power, and put forth his human effort to subdue sin, and stand complete in Christ. Fundamentals of Christian Education, 429-430.*

*The Spirit of God does not propose to do our part either in the willing or the doing. . . . As soon as we incline our will to harmonize with God's will, the grace of Christ stands ready to cooperate with the human agent; but it will not be the substitute to do our work independent of our resolving and decidedly acting. In Heavenly Places, 27.*

*The gospel is to be preached. . . . in clear lines, showing that obedience is the condition of gaining eternal life. The Seventh-day Adventist Bible Commentary vol. 7, 972.*

The gospel requires our obedience in response to the love of God as displayed at the cross. In chapter 10 of Romans Paul speaks of the "gospel of peace." (Scripture teaches, "Great peace have they which love thy law.") In verses 16 Paul exclaims of ancient Israel, "But they have not all obeyed the gospel." In this complaint about ancient Israel is the truth that the gospel demands obedience.

*In flaming fire taking vengeance on them that know not God, and that obey not the gospel of our Lord Jesus Christ. 2 Thessalonians 1 :8.*

*God requires obedience, not for the purpose of showing His authority, but that we may become one with Him in character. We shall find in God the attributes of character needed to form characters after His likeness. We are to form characters that are in harmony with the Deity. Thus our natures become spiritualized in every faculty. Special Testimonies, Series B, No. 7, page 7.*

*Obedience is the first price of eternal life. 1888 Materials, 1477.*

## **Gospel Conditions**

### **Faith**

*But without faith it is impossible to please him: for he that cometh to God must believe that he is, and that he is the rewarder of them that diligently seek him. Hebrews 11 :6.*

*The gospel message proclaimed by Christ's disciples. . . . set before men the hope, through faith and obedience, of sharing the inheritance of the saints in light. Christ's Object Lessons, 226-227.*

### **Surrender**

In addition to repentance, faith, and obedience, "The gospel demands. . . . unreserved consecration to God." Review and Herald, April 12, 1887. When our repentance and surrender are complete so that Christ dwells within us, then "The gospel. . . . must be appropriated as the branch appropriates the nourishment in the sap." Review and Herald, January 8, 1889. Through the power of Christ the gospel can

and must be “lived,” Medical Ministry, 236, and “practiced.” Ibid., 23.

Salvation has been provided for every man who will respond to the provisions, the terms, and the conditions contained in the gospel. Christ surrendered His divine being for eternity; then He joined Himself with sinful flesh through the incarnation, and then He died the sinner’s death in order to redeem fallen humanity. But the salvation offered to mankind because of these actions is effective only when the sinner responds to the provisions supplied, and meets the conditions set forth within the gospel. If the gospel were unconditional, Jesus would not have had to die. His death not only demonstrated divine love, but it also upheld the divine law. The gospel plan is the perfect blend of mercy and justice.

*This goody-goody religion that makes light of sin and that is forever dwelling upon the love of God to the sinner, encourages the sinner to believe that God will save him while he continues in sin and he knows it to be sin. This is the way that many are doing who profess to believe present truth. The truth is kept apart from their life, and that is the reason it has no more power to convict and convert the soul. There must be a straining of every nerve and spirit and muscle to leave the world, its customs, its practices, and its fashions. . . . If you put away sin and exercise living faith, the riches of heaven’s blessings will be yours. Selected Messages, book 3, 155.*

### **Chapter 3- Righteousness by Faith**

Humanity is of course incapable, of itself, of meeting the conditions contained in the gospel. Man can meet the conditions of the gospel only by responding to the call of the Holy Spirit and receiving the righteousness that is of faith. To receive and maintain this righteousness is man’s greatest need.

*But seek ye first the kingdom of God, and his righteousness. Matthew 6:33.*

Righteousness is doing right works, See 1 John 3:7. Faith that produces right works is the only real faith. See Galatians 5:6. A true understanding of both faith or righteousness cannot be separated from works. Works are a man’s experience, either good or bad. Therefore righteousness, which man receives by the twofold process of justification and sanctification, is primarily a term used to describe an experience. Likewise, justification and sanctification are best understood when viewed experientially.

*The faith that justifies always produces first true repentance, and then good works, which are the fruit of that faith. There is no saving faith that does not produce good fruit. God gave Christ to our world to become the sinner’s substitute. The moment true faith in the merits of the costly atoning sacrifice is exercised, claiming Christ as a personal Saviour, that moment the sinner is justified before God, because he is pardoned. Selected Messages, book 3, 195.*

*Sinners can be justified by God only when He pardons their sins, remits the punishment they deserve, and treats them as though they were really just and had not sinned, receiving them into divine favor and treating them as if they were righteous. They are justified alone through the imputed righteousness of Christ. Ibid., 194.*

Calvary is not justification. Calvary is the location where the possibility for justification was secured. The death of Christ is not justification, it is the infinite price paid that man might receive justification. To simply believe that Jesus died for the sins of the world does not justify. The devils believe and tremble. To be justified we must believe and fulfill the conditions included in the plan of salvation.

*A sinner is justified by God when he repents of his sins. Ibid., 193.*

*A knowledge of Christ will avail nothing unless we become like him in character. . . . Christ is of no value to us unless He is formed within, the hope of glory. That I May Know Him, 107.*

Justification and sanctification are terms that define and illustrate the experience of righteousness in the believer. Both are the work of God by His Spirit, but both require the believer's cooperation. Each term describes a different aspect of the total process of righteousness by faith.

*None are living Christians unless they have a daily experience in the things of God and daily practice self denial, cheerfully bearing the cross and following Christ. Every living Christian will advance daily in the divine life. As he advances towards perfection, he experiences a conversion to God every day; and this conversion is not completed until he attains to perfection of Christian character, a full preparation for the finishing touch of immortality. Testimonies, vol. 2, 505.*

In order to begin the experience of righteousness by faith, a believer must meet the conditions of repentance, surrender, faith, confession, and obedience. When a man fulfills these conditions as illustrated in the story of the Pharisee and the publican, (see Luke 18:9-14), he is at that moment justified. Justification is a description of the "attitude" that a believer must have in order to receive pardon for his sins. This attitude must be maintained continually if one is going to remain justified. At the moment the conditions for justification are met by a man, sanctification also begins. Sanctification is a person's growth in holiness. Without the attitude of the humility that allows justification, sanctification cannot be retained. Justification describes the attitude that a man must have to receive righteousness; whereas sanctification is the experience that comes with the reception of the Holy Spirit in the life of the believer. Sanctification is the principle of "by beholding we become changed." It is impossible to have "Christ in you" without becoming "conformed to the image of the Son."

*God's forgiveness is not merely a judicial act by which He sets us free from condemnation. It is not only forgiveness for sin, but reclaiming from sin. It is the out flowing of redeeming love that transforms the heart. David had a true conception of forgiveness when he prayed, "Create in me a clean heart, O God; and renew a right spirit within me." Psalm 51:10. And again he says, "As far as the east is from west, so far hath He removed our transgressions from us." Psalm 103:12. Thoughts From the Mount of Blessing, 114.*

Justification and sanctification are achieved by the believer upon faith, and both must be present simultaneously for the experience of righteousness to exist in the believer's life.

*When through repentance and faith we accept Christ as our Saviour, the Lord pardons our sins, and remits the penalty prescribed for the transgression of the law. The sinner then stands before God as a just person; he is taken into favor with Heaven, and through the Spirit has fellowship with the Father and Son. Then there is yet another work to be accomplished, and this is of a progressive nature. The soul is to be sanctified through the truth. And this is accomplished through faith. For it is only through the grace of Christ, which we receive through faith, that character can be transformed. Selected Messages, book 3, 191.*

*God requires the entire surrender of the heart, before justification can take place; and in order for man to retain justification, there must be continual obedience, through*

*active, living faith that works by love and purifies the soul. Ibid., book 1, 366.*

Righteousness by faith then is maintaining the attitude of the publican, which brings the Holy Spirit into one's heart and allows God to live out His life in the believer. The provision for this experience to happen in the life of a sinner is the gospel.

## **Chapter 4 - The Scope of the Gospel**

The everlasting gospel is not one or two isolated, overemphasized truths. It is the sum total of all the truth. The gospel is the power of God, and the power of God is the truth, and the truth is the Word of God. All of these, (the gospel, the power of God, the truth, the Word of God) are what sanctifies the believer.

*The gospel in the Old and New Testaments is not to be contemplated from a narrow, single aspect, as one or two men may view it. How large, how broad, how extensive, is the gospel! Special Testimonies to Ministers, Series A, 115.*

*The gospel is the plan of salvation. Review and Herald, March 28, 1912.*

*In life and teaching, Jesus was the gospel. That I May Know Him, 97.*

*The word of truth, "It is written" is the gospel we are to preach. Testimonies, vol. 6, 19.*

*"The gospel includes health reform in all its phases," Medical Ministry, 259, and dress reform, Testimonies, vol 6, 96. It also includes the teaching of "Christ's second coming is at hand." Christ's Object Lessons, 226-228.*

*So, as much is now in me is, I am ready to preach the gospel to you that are in Rome also. For I am not ashamed of the gospel of Christ: for it is the power of God unto salvation to every one that believeth; to the Jew first, and also to the Greek. Romans 1:15-16.*

*The gospel is called the power of God unto salvation because God alone can make the truth a power which sanctifies the soul. The Seventh day Adventist Bible Commentary, vol. 7, 940.*

Once again, the purpose of the gospel is to reproduce the image of God in man. The gospel is the plan designed to accomplish that purpose, and it contains condition and terms. When man accepts these terms and conditions he enters into the twofold experience of justification and sanctification, bringing the very righteousness of God into the his life. That righteousness, which is by faith through grace, is demonstrated by the works or fruits that the man exhibits through the power of the indwelling Spirit.

*By the power of the Holy Spirit the moral image of God is to be perfected in the character. We are to be wholly transformed into the likeness of Christ. Testimonies to Ministers, 506.*

This plan of the gospel, which is designed to accomplish this righteous experience in the life of the believer, is found, not in a few isolated doctrines, but within all revealed truth. The purpose of this plan, to reproduce the image of God in man, is the underlying theme of the entire Scriptures. Both the plan and the purpose are the everlasting gospel. It was to set more prominently before God's people the plan and the purpose that God raised up AT. Jones and E.J. Waggoner. We will now briefly consider their message.

## Chapter 5 - Jones, Waggoner, and 1888

*The Lord in His great mercy sent a most precious message to His people through Elders Waggoner and Jones. This messages was to bring more prominently before the world the uplifted Saviour, the sacrifice for the sins of the whole world. It presented justification through faith in the Surety; it invited the people to receive the righteousness of Christ, which is made manifest in obedience to all the commandments of God. Many had lost sight of Jesus. They needed to have their eyes directed to His divine person, His merits, and His changeless love for the human family. All power is given into His hands, that He may dispense rich gifts unto men, imparting the priceless gift of His own righteousness to the helpless human agent. This is the message that God commanded to be given to the world. It is the third angel's message, which is to be proclaimed with a loud voice, and attended with. the outpouring of His Spirit m a large measure. 1888 Materials, 1336-1337.*

Let us break down this statement briefly,

1. It was to bring more prominently the uplifted Saviour before the world through the experience of victory over sin in the life of the believer.

2. The sacrifice that Heaven had made to recover the fallen race from sin was to be uplifted to the world. The sacrifice not only included Christ surrendering the omnipresent aspect of His divinity in exchange for the form and nature of fallen men, but also the sacrifice of living among fallen men, and submitting to the death of the cross.

3. It was to present justification by faith which produces righteousness in the life of the believer.

4. It was to proclaim that through Christ's power the law could be kept by fallen humanity.

5. It was the third angel's message that, when accompanied by the outpouring of the latter rain, will swell into the loud-cry message.

*The soul-saving message, the third angel's message, is the message to be given to the world. The commandments of God and the faith of Jesus are both important, immensely important, and must be given with equal force and power. The first part of the message has been dwelt upon mostly, the last part casually. The faith of Jesus is not comprehended. We must talk it, we must live it, we must pray it, and educate the people to bring this part of the message into their home life. "Let this mind be in you, which was also in Christ Jesus." (Philippians 2:5). Selected Messages, book 3, 184.*

A simple explanation of Jones and Waggoner's message is victory over sin. They presented a powerful picture of Christ's work for us, and in us. They presented the eternal power that Jesus makes available to all who will avail themselves of it. The Lord opened the Scriptures to these brethren, and they recognized the gospel throughout the entire Bible. It is a mistaken position that their presentations are no longer relevant. Their messages are still as powerful and profound as 100 years ago. But although they took these truths to new heights and depths of understanding, they presented a message consistent with the Bible and the Spirit of Prophecy.

*I have had the question asked, What do you think of this light which these men [A.T. Jones and E.J. Waggoner] are presenting? Why, I have been presenting it to you for the last forty-five years—the matchless charms of Christ. This is what I have been trying to present before your minds. Manuscript Releases, vol. 1, 142.*

They both went astray, and there came a time when their message no longer agreed with truth. But before that time their message was safe and important. Their writings are not to be understood as on the level of prophetic writings, but the prophet endorsed their message in such a mighty way that to ignore their contributions is tantamount to disregarding the Spirit of Prophecy.

## **Not Infallible**

*I believe without a doubt that God has given precious truth at the right time to Brother Jones and Brother Waggoner. Do I place them as infallible? Do I say that they will not make a statement or have an idea that cannot be questioned or that cannot be error? Do I say so? No, I do not say any such thing. Nor do I say that of any man in the world. But I do say God has sent light, and do be careful how you treat it. We want the truth as it is in Jesus. 1888 Materials, 565.*

When considering the work of modern Israel and that of ancient Israel, we may compare the work of Ellen White with that of Moses; and of Jones, Waggoner, and their message as the modern antitype of Joshua and Caleb. Both the ancient and the modern messages were rejected. Both messages proclaimed God's power to deliver. Both rejections prolonged the time in the wilderness.

## **A Rejected Message**

*We may have to remain here in this world because of insubordination many more years, as did the children of Israel; but for Christ's sake, His people should not add sin to sin by charging God with the consequence of their own wrong course of action. Evangelism, 696.*

*God has given Brother Jones and Brother Waggoner a message for the people. You do not believe that God has upheld them, but He has given them precious light, and their message has fed the people of God. When you reject the message borne by these men, you reject Christ, the Giver of the message. 1888 Materials, 1353.*

*They knew not that God had sent these young men, Elders Jones and Waggoner, to bear a special message to them, which they treated with ridicule and contempt, not realizing that the heavenly intelligences were looking upon them and registering their words in the books of heaven. Ibid., 1043.*

The following information is all from the 1888 Materials except where otherwise noted. It illuminates the significance of the message they brought.

## **A Special Work**

*Elders Jones and Waggoner were given a special work to do for these last days. 1395.*

*He has given these men [A. T. Jones and E. 1. Waggoner] a work to do, and a message to bear which is present truth for this time. They knew that wherever this message comes its fruits are good. A vigor and a vital energy are brought into the church, and where the message is accepted, there hope and courage and faith beam in the countenances of all those who open their eyes to see, their understanding to perceive and their hearts to receive the great treasure of truth. 228.*

## **The Laodicean Message**

*The message given us by AT. Jones, and E.J. Waggoner is the message of God to the Laodicean church, and woe be unto anyone who professes to believe the truth and yet does not reflect to others the God-given rays. 1052.*

## **The Investigative Judgment Message**

*If you had been walking in the light, you would have drunk of the cup full of the wine of truth that has been held to your lips; but no, you have but in a partial way been in harmony with the work that brethren Jones and Waggoner have under God been doing to bring up the church to understand their true state and come to the supper prepared for them. The richest blessings from heaven have been proffered, but as represented in the parable, many have clung to their old citizen's dress, not accepting the dress prepared for them by the Lord Jesus Christ. 1137.*

## **The Loud-Cry Message**

*An unwillingness to yield up preconceived opinions, and to accept this truth, lay at the foundation of a large share of the opposition manifested at Minneapolis against the Lord's message through Brethren Waggoner and Jones. By exciting that opposition, Satan succeeded in shutting away from our people, in a great measure, the special power of the Holy Spirit that God longed to impart to them. The enemy prevented them from obtaining that efficiency which might have been theirs in carrying the truth to the world, as the apostles proclaimed it after the day of Pentecost. The light that is to lighten the whole earth with its glory was resisted, and by the action of our own brethren has been in a great degree kept away from the world. 1575.*

*The Lord has raised up Brother Jones and Brother Waggoner to proclaim a message to the world to prepare a people to stand in the day of God. The world is suffering the need of additional light to come to them upon the Scriptures,-additional proclamation of the principles of purity, lowliness, faith, and the righteousness of Christ. This is the power of God unto salvation to every one that believeth. Many will be moved and humbled. After a time they will drink of the waters of life. Jesus proclaimed Himself the bread of life: "I am the living bread which came down from heaven: if any man eat of this bread, he shall live for ever: and the bread that I will give is my flesh, which I will give for the life of the world." John 6:51. 1814-1815.*

We have presented here the credentials of the message and the work of Jones and Waggoner. We stand in support of the message they brought to this church while they maintained their walk with the Lord. The problem that has arisen at this present time is not the content of their message, but a misinterpretation of their message by those who claim to have the greatest insight into that message.

Because of this misconception as we address the book *Beyond Belief*, we need to recognize that the theories in the book have been strongly supported by the 1888 Message Study Committee. To address the problems within the book necessitates addressing the problems within the 1888 Message Study Committee. From here on in this article we will address these theological problems as the New View.

## **Chapter 6 - The New View**

When one looks at a symmetrical spider web it is impossible to know just where

the spider began to spin his web. . Likewise to address the New View it is impossible to know which incorrect premise developed first, and which was created to support the last, and so on, and so on. We will thus proceed to demonstrate the problems that we see in the New View from what appears to be the logical sequence of this theology, although we cannot be sure what premise of the New View came first.

Before we begin, let us state adamantly that we believe the motives of everyone involved with the propagation of this New View are pure, but we likewise believe their conclusions are wrong. With those facts in mind, let us begin with the two Adams.

## The Two Adams

The New View takes the passage in Romans 5 and 1 Corinthians 15 that deal with Adam and Christ and develops a type-antitype illustration that sets the foundation for their understanding of justification. In support of their position they refer to the writings and the sermons of Jones and Waggoner, and even of W.W. Prescott. We find no fault with the Bible type-antitype of the two Adams, nor do we find a problem with Jones, Waggoner, or Prescott's view of the two Adams. We do see a fundamental flaw in the New View's analysis of this truth. The New View makes several correct type-and-antitype observations about the two Adams. They are as follows; Adam is the first Adam, Christ is the second Adam.

Adam brought sin, death, condemnation, to all, by one, was earthly.

Christ brought righteousness, life, justification, to all, by one, was spiritual.

Notice in this type-anti type illustration, that sometimes the antitype fulfills the type by an opposite, that is, sin-righteousness; death-life; condemnation-justification; earthly-spiritual. But sometimes antitypes fulfill the type with an agreement, that is, to all men-to all men; by one man-by one man. We are in agreement with this analysis to this point. We will now address where we disagree and begin to demonstrate where this disagreement leads.

The adherents of the New View teach correctly that no man has a choice to be or not to be part of the first Adam's family tree. We can all trace our lineage to Adam through no choice of our own. Therefore they conclude that all men are in the second Adam through no choice of their own. In a type-and-antitype illustration we must determine the correct fulfillment based upon evidence. There is no evidence demonstrating that just because we had no choice to be born into the first Adam, we therefore have no choice but to be in the second Adam. Sometimes the fulfillment agrees; sometimes it is the opposite. The New View believes that all men are in Christ, through no choice of their own. We believe this concept goes directly contrary to the Bible; to the Spirit of Prophecy; and to the teachings of Jones, Waggoner, and Prescott: We believe being in Christ, the second Adam, is something a man chooses; and when he chooses to be born again, he is a new creation in Christ Jesus. This birth is what Jesus was talking about to Nicodemus. Consider the following:

*Jesus answered and said unto him, Verily, verily, I say unto thee, Except a man be born again, he cannot see the kingdom of God. John 3:3.*

*Jesus answered, Verily, verily, I say unto thee, Except a man be born of water and of the Spirit, he cannot enter the kingdom of God. John 3:5.*

The New View at this point divides justification into two phases. The first its advocates call the legal or forensic, and the second the justification-by-faith experience.

They build this idea of legally being in Christ by dealing with the corporate nature of Adam and of the second Adam, Christ. They illustrate that God views all men in Adam from a corporate point of view, and likewise He views all men in Christ from a corporate view. Before we deal with the next ramification of this position, which is their two phases of justification, let us address a classic example they use to describe this corporate nature of mankind. They refer to Genesis 25:23, which states:

*And the Lord said unto her, Two nations are in thy womb, and two manner of people shall be separated from thy bowels; and the one people shall be stronger than the other people; and the elder shall serve the younger.*

They use this text and others to demonstrate that God recognizes the entire descendants of a man by merely looking at the man. We agree, but what they do not do with this verse is very important, and it is a continual blindness throughout their evaluation of the biblical corporate concept. It affects their theology all the way through. What they fail to acknowledge is that God saw two nations in Rebekah, but He did not see the descendants of Jacob in the family of Esau, nor did He see the descendants of Esau in the family of Jacob. Both these men represented different families. Likewise the story of the two Adams represents two families, and God has the ability to see who will be the descendants of the first or the second Adam. But in this type-antitype illustration we have no choice about being in the first Adam, but we must choose to be in the second.

The New View's argument on this point states that because the first Adam's sin touched all men, therefore the second Adam's righteousness touches all men. The second Adam does touch all men, but not with justification. Christ's life and death provide a probationary life for all men that they may choose to enter the family tree of the second Adam through the provisions of the gospel, or they may choose to stay in the family tree of the first Adam. Christ definitely touches all men with a period of probation so that they may choose to be born again as a child of God, and no longer remain as a child of Satan, but this probationary period is not justification. The Bible and the Spirit of Prophecy define this gift to all men that Christ provides as grace, not justification. It is here that the difference between the advocates of the New View and the advocates of biblical justification begin to part. .

## ***Chapter 7- Two Phases of Justification***

This belief that all men are in Christ opens the doors to other problems in the New View. One of them is that justification consists of two phases. The first phase is the legal or forensic justification that all receive, and the second phase is the experience of justification that is received at the new birth. There are of course passages in the Bible, the Spirit of Prophecy, and in the teachings of Jones and Waggoner that do speak to the legal act accomplished at Calvary; but the evidence demonstrates that the legal action is effective only when the sinner responds to the conditions connected with the gospel. Repentance is the only way the sinner can receive justification, and to believe that we are justified while still in our sins challenges a multitude of passages in inspiration.

*Keep thee far from a false matter; and the innocent and righteous slay not: for I will not justify the wicked. Exodus 23:7.*

## **Actual, Unconditional Salvation**

The New View believes that a primary part of “the most precious message” as brought by Jones and Waggoner was the revelation of this two-phased justification. It is certainly bewildering that while claiming that in essence this two-phased justification is the heart of what Jones and Waggoner presented, we have no sermons or articles by either gentleman, or by Ellen White, that specifically address and clarify this position. One would think that if it was the message that was to lighten the earth with its glory, we should see some specific presentations on this topic. Instead, what is brought forth from Jones, Waggoner, Ellen White, and Prescott simply does not sustain the idea when read in context.

The New View teaches that this first phase, legal, forensic justification actually and unconditionally saves every human being, while they are yet sinners. They believe that when the sinner realizes that Christ has already actually and unconditionally justified and saved him, it will so overwhelm the sinner with a realization of God’s love, that it will change his heart. In connection with this unconditional salvation they believe that when the sinner realizes that Christ already died the second death in his place, his heart will be so softened by that manifestation of God’s agape love, that it is actually easier to be saved than lost.

We do not want to downplay the story of the cross and the love there revealed, but we think God uses that story to call or draw the sinner to Himself and then justifies him. We believe the calling of God is unconditional, but salvation and justification are conditional.

## **Calling, Drawing or Justifying?**

The New View believes that in the life and death of Christ all men were actually and unconditionally saved, until they reject the Holy Spirit and are lost. They view all men as saved in Christ, whereas the Bible and the Spirit of Prophecy speak of the world as unsaved.

*Shall we not as a people, by our business arrangements, by our attitude toward a world unsaved, bear a testimony even more clear and decisive than that borne by us twenty or thirty years ago? Testimonies, vol. 7, 54.*

*The message of the third angel of Revelation 14 is now to be proclaimed not only in lands far off, but in neglected places close by, where multitudes dwell unwarned and unsaved. God is calling his people at this time to a long-delayed work. Review and Herald, April 7, 1910.*

Not only does God view the world as unsaved, but the third angel's message also views men as unsaved. The New View takes an opposite perspective to this, and teaches that all men are actually saved. They teach that because Christ was the second Adam, what He accomplished is actually an accomplished fact in the sense that all men are in the second Adam and therefore in Christ. The truth is that no unsaved person is in Christ, for the unsaved are out of Christ. Consider the following:

## **Two Phases of Justification**

*The neglect of home religion, the neglect to train your children, is most displeasing to God. If one of your children were in the river, battling with the waves and in imminent danger of drowning, what a stir there would be! What efforts would be made,*

*what prayers offered, what enthusiasm manifested, to save the human life! But here are your children out of Christ, their souls unsaved. Perhaps they are even rude and uncourteous, a reproach to the Adventist name. They are perishing without hope and without God in the world, and you are careless and unconcerned. Testimonies, vol. 5, 423. (All emphasis supplied unless otherwise noted.)*

The truth is that if you are saved, you are in Christ. Notice in the following quotation the connection between being saved and being justified:

*It is God that circumcises the heart. The whole work is the Lord's from the beginning to the end. The perishing sinner may say: "I am a lost sinner; but Christ came to seek and to save that which was lost. He says, 'I came not to call the righteous, but sinners to repentance' (Mark 2: 17). I am a sinner, and He died upon Calvary's cross to save me. I need not remain a moment longer unsaved. He died and rose again for my justification, and He will save me now. I accept the forgiveness He has promised." Selected Messages, book 1, 392.*

If this two-phase justification were truth, Ellen White's position on justification would have to be thrown out. With her specific statements about the justification-by-faith experience and her lack of information on the so-called first-phase legal, forensic justification, her authority as a prophetess would certainly need to be challenged. She viewed people as unsaved, and out of Christ, until they came to Christ and accepted the provisions of the gospel. Consider the following:

*Many, many souls are unsaved. Fasten yourselves by faith to the Lord, and tell sinners that the Saviour is calling for them. Entreat them to tarry not; for He is calling, "Come; for all things are now ready." Review and Herald, July 26, 1898.*

*But this time has not yet come. Mercy's sweet voice is still to be heard. The Lord is now calling sinners to come to Him. The Seventh-day Adventist Bible Commentary, vol. 3, 1150.*

Notice here that the souls that are being called are not saved. What the New View confuses as the first phase of justification, is really the calling of God. They take the attributes of the calling of God, and assign to them the new title of first-phase, legal, forensic justification in order to sustain their concept of the second Adam.

The calling or drawing of God are interchangeable concepts, and just as the so-called first-phase justification bases its message on what happened at Calvary, the calling or drawing is also the story of Calvary, for Jesus stated, "And I, in being lifted up from the earth, will draw all men unto me." John 12:32.

*The repentance that God accepts is a repentance that needs not to be repented of—a repentance revealed by a radical change of mind and heart. The heart must be brought into subjection to Christ, and a repentance that brings about such a change can never originate with man. Only from Him who declared, "I, if I be lifted up from the earth, will draw all men unto Me," can such repentance proceed. As the sinner yields to the drawing power of Christ's love, sorrow for sin and a desire to turn from his evil ways fill his heart and, as he seeks help from God, strength from on high is given him. The Saviour says, "Let him take hold of My strength, that he may make peace with Me; and he shall make peace with Me." Signs of the Times, March 18, 1893.*

When the New View turns the calling or drawing of God into a justification that includes all humanity, they of necessity make this justification unconditional. The reason is that they confuse justification with the calling and retain the attributes of the calling of

God. Since calling and drawing are unconditional, the New View's first phase justification is likewise unconditional. Consistency demands to turn this first-phase justification and salvation into an unconditional salvation. But salvation has conditions. The calling of God does not. As you consider the next quotation for its content, ask yourself why at this point Mrs. White does not take time to address the first-phase legal justification if it were actually truth.

*The question will come up, How is it? Is it by conditions that we receive salvation? Never by conditions do we come to Christ. And if we come to Christ, then what is the condition? The condition is that by living faith we lay hold wholly and entirely upon the merits of the blood of a crucified and risen Saviour. When we do that, then we work the works of righteousness. But when God is calling the sinner in our world, and inviting him, there is no condition there; he is drawn by the invitation of Christ and it is not, "Now you have got to respond in order to come to God." The sinner comes, and as he comes and views Christ elevated upon that cross of Calvary, which God impresses upon his mind, there is a love beyond anything that is imagined that he has taken hold of. And what then? As he beholds that love, why he says that he is a sinner. Well, then, what is sin? Why at once he has to come here to find out. There is no definition given in our world but that transgression is the transgression of the law; and therefore he finds out what sin is. And there is repentance toward God; and what then?-why, faith toward our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ that can speak pardon to the transgressor. 1888 Materials, 537.*

*What is to bring the sinner to the knowledge of his sins unless he knows what sin is? The only definition of sin in the Word of God is given us in 1 John 3:4: "Sin is the transgression of the law." The sinner must be made to feel that he is a transgressor. Christ dying upon the cross of Calvary is drawing his attention. Why did Christ die? Because it was the only means for man to be saved. He became our substitute and surety. He took upon Himself our sins that He might impute His own righteousness to all who believe in Him. The love of Jesus Christ displayed for man in the sufferings He endured on the cross of Calvary is a mystery even to the angelic host of heaven. Amazing love of the Father to give His Son to die to ransom the sinner! Oh, what love, what inexpressible love! Ibid., 780.*

Mrs. White is strangely silent on this so-called forensic justification, yet she is perfectly clear that the gospel is conditional, but the calling is not.

*You are to yield to the drawing power of Christ's love to-day, and come to Him as you are. As you come, He will continue to draw you, until every thought shall be brought into captivity to Jesus. When the enemy would keep you from your Saviour, accusing you of being a sinner, tell him that you are entitled to go to the Lord, since He has said, "I came not to call the righteous, but sinners to repentance." The accuser of the brethren told the repentant publican that he was a sinner; and he dared not so much as lift up his eyes to heaven, but smote upon his breast, and cried, "God, be merciful to me, a sinner," and he went down to his house justified. The coming of the sinner is not unwelcome to Christ. He says, "Come unto Me, all ye that labour and are heavy laden, and I will give you rest. Take my yoke upon you, and learn of Me; for I am meek and lowly in heart, and ye shall find rest unto your souls." The Messenger, January 18, 1893.*

The New View argues here that the calling is the first-phase (forensic or legal) justification. But we are plainly told that calling and justification are different.

*Calling and justification are not one and the same thing. Calling is the drawing of the sinner to Christ, and it is a work wrought by the Holy Spirit upon the heart, convicting of sin, and inviting to repentance. Selected Messages, book 1, 390.*

*When the sinner believes that Christ is his personal Saviour, then according to His unfulfilling promises, God pardons his sin and justifies him freely. The repentant soul realizes that his justification comes because Christ, as his Substitute and Surety, has died for him, is his atonement and righteousness. Faith and Works, 101.*

If the New View is correct, then all who are called are justified and glorified, and the all, is all men. We reject this position. God offers His salvation to all men, but it is provisional. When God uses this type of universal language He is speaking of provisions for all, not the inclusion of all.

## **Chapter 8 - Universal Language**

The New View argues strongly that the passages in the Bible, the Spirit of Prophecy, and the writings of Jones and Waggoner presenting the universal aspect of God's calling demonstrate that all men are actually justified and saved until they reject that salvation. Consider the following example:

*Therefore as by the offence of one judgment came upon all men to condemnation; even so by the righteousness of one the free gift came upon all men unto justification of life. Romans 5:18.*

*And we know that all things work together for good to them that love God, to them that are called according to his purpose. For whom he did foreknow, he also did predestinate to be conformed to the image of his Son, that he might be the firstborn among many brethren. Moreover whom he did predestinate, them he also called: and whom he called, them he also justified; and whom he justified, them he also glorified. Romans 8:28-30.*

The New View states that Romans 5: 18 proves that all men are justified. Then Romans 8:28-30 would necessarily show that those who are justified, glorified, and called are those that have been predestinated. How then do we understand the many following passages?

*Your obedience to God's commandments will prove that you are predestinated to a glorious inheritance. You are elected to be laborers together with God, to work in harmony with Christ, to wear His yoke, to lift His burden, and to follow in His footsteps. You have been provided with means whereby you may ascertain what to do to make your calling and election sure. Search the Scriptures, and you will find that not a son or daughter of Adam is elected to be saved in disobedience to God's commandments. Review and Herald, October 28, 1897.*

*Wonderful possibilities are provided for every one who has faith in Christ. No walls are built to keep any living soul from salvation. The predestination, or election, of which God speaks, includes all who will accept Christ as a personal Saviour, who will return to their loyalty, to perfect obedience to all God's commandments. This is the effectual salvation of a peculiar people, chosen by God from among men. All who are willing to be saved by Christ are the elect of God. It is the obedient who are predestinated from the foundation of the world. "To as many as received him, to them he gave power to become the sons of God, even to as many as believed on him." Gospel*

*Herald, June 11, 1902.*

## **Chapter 9 - The “In Christ” Motif**

As we finish the overview of the New View we need to address briefly the “in Christ” motif. One of the centerpieces of the New View’s teaching is this motif of being in Christ. This phrase comes from the Bible, and was a powerful theme used by Jones, Waggoner, and Prescott during the post-1888 time period. During the 1895 General Conference session Jones and Prescott preached a series of sermons developing this motif in a powerful way. Many propagators of the New View point to this series to support their position regarding the two Adams. A close study of the materials does not support the all-important basic premise of the New View, however; that basic premise being that everyone is in Christ, or in the second Adam. Let us now look at some extracts from this series of sermons given in 1895 by Jones and Prescott.

### **Prescott and the “In Christ” Motif**

At this point we contend that the whole New View theology stands or falls on the premise of whether we are in Christ, the second Adam, by virtue of our birth into humanity, as opposed to being born again into Christ. It is primarily this theme we will look at as we dissect three sermons from W. W. Prescott. These three sermons have been put into a pamphlet by members of the 1888 Message Study Committee, and may be obtained through them. We propose a few questions to illustrate the quotations:

What does it mean that Jesus is the second Head of the family?

“And this second man, the Lord from heaven, sustains the same relation to his family that Adam sustained to his family. That is, He became the second father of the family.” Page 3. “Now what does it mean to us that Jesus Christ became the second head of this human family? It means this: Just as, when Adam was created, all the members of the human family were created in him, so also when the second Man was created’ according to God in righteousness and true holiness,’ all the members of that family were created in Him. It means that, as God saw in Adam all the members of the human family, so He saw in Christ, the second Father of the family, all the members of the divine-human family.” Page 6.

Please note here that Prescott calls Adam the father of the human family, and Christ the Father of the divine-human family. When God sees all men in Christ, He sees all men that are members of the divine-human family.

How does one identify a member of the divine-human family?

“Mark 3: 31 ‘There came then his brethren and his mother (Now these were those that were actually related to Him by the ties of the natural flesh), and, standing without, sent unto him, calling him. And the multitude sat about him, and they said unto him, Behold, thy mother and thy brethren without seek for thee. And he answered them, saying, Who is my mother, or my brethren? And he looked round about on them which sat about him, and said, Behold my mother and my brethren! For whosoever shall do the will of God, the same is my brother, and my sister, and mother.’ That is, whoever is born into the family of God is as closely related to Jesus Christ, and that by flesh and blood, as is a mother to her own son.” Pages 9-10.

To do the will of God brings one into the divine-human family.

What is the only question to be settled?

“And do you not see that the only question to be settled is, Are we in Him? That is all. Are we in Him? If so, just as soon as we come into the family, we avail ourselves of all the rights and privileges of the family.” Page 18.

We must come into the divine-human family to be in Christ. We are not simply in Christ by virtue of being a member of the human family.

How are we born into the divine-human family?

“Because when we are born into the divine-human family, and become really in Him, by our choice. . . . Everything comes to us just as soon as we are born into the family, just as soon as we become sons of God.” Pages 18-19.

We must choose to be born into this divine-human family.

What is Christian experience?

“Shall I remain in Him? Shall I continue to choose Him, and be in Him? That is Christian experience. . . . It is now a good time to say that this union by which we are in Him is of that nature that it is impossible except as He is also in us. And so reveal His Son ‘in me’ .” Page 19.

Christian experience is choosing to stay in Christ, and it is impossible to be in Him if He is not in us. Note here that Prescott teaches clearly that it is impossible to be in Christ, without Him being in us.

Can we leave the divine-human family?

“Just as soon as one is in Him, he is safe from the pursuer just as long as he stays in Him. If he gets outside of Him, it is at his own risk. He is likely then to pay the penalty, but if he abides in Him, he is safe. ‘There is no condemnation’.” Page 24.

Does one receive the benefits of justification before he yields to Christ’s drawing?

“Because of that, every human being receives a tendency or feels a drawing toward righteousness; and if he does not resist, he will be drawn to righteousness, but he will receive for himself no consideration because of that drawing to righteousness unless he, himself, yields to that tendency. He will be drawn to Christ, he will be in Christ, and then he will personally receive the benefits of justification of life which came upon all men, just as in the other case when he yields to the tendency to sin he receives the condemnation personally which came upon all men in Adam.” Page 27.

Justification comes only when we yield, and we do not receive the benefits of justification until we yield. If Prescott, Jones, and Waggoner actually taught and believed in a two-phase justification, why does Prescott not take this opportunity to clarify which justification he is dealing with here? He is specifically stating that this particular justification is the one that benefits all men.

What is necessary for human beings to lay hold of justification?

“But while he has done all this for every human being, yet it avails only for those who personally apprehend it by their own faith, who lay hold of the justification provided. . . . Then the provision which has been made freely for all avails for him as an individual and when, by faith, he has made a personal application to his own case of the justification which comes from God through the blood of Christ, then as a consequence, as the inevitable result, Christ’s works appear in him.” Pages 28-29.

The provision of justification is laid hold of by faith.

When are we born into the divine-human family?

“The moment he is born into the family of God and believes in Jesus Christ. . . . In Him was life. There is the secret of it all. In Him was life. Apart from Him there is no life. When we are in Him by birth into the family, then we receive life.” Page 32.

We are born into the divine-human family when we believe in Jesus Christ. Before this time we are in the human family, which is represented by the first Adam, and is an unsaved condition.

W. W. Prescott presented these sermons at the same time and place that AT. Jones was presenting his 26 sermons on the third angel’s message. Jones even refers to Prescott’s presentations within his own sermons. Evidently they saw no discrepancy between their presentations. Prescott presented a total of six sermons at these meetings, but these three are the ones put together in the little book titled *In Christ, The Divine-Human Family*. There is no reason to think that his presentations upholds the New View. He made a point to teach that we are in the divine-human family of which the second Adam, Jesus Christ, is the Head, only as we choose to respond to the provisions necessary to receive justification. Before we turn to Jones, let us consider a sermon by Prescott presented at Armandale Camp Meeting in Victoria, Australia, on October 31, 1895. It was published in *The Bible Echo*, January 6, 1896. What makes this sermon of interest is not that Prescott is once again addressing the “in Christ motif,” but the glorious approvals it received from Ellen White. Let us consider some of those first.

*I have just been listening to a discourse given by Professor Prescott. It was a most powerful appeal to the people. . . . The presence of the Lord is in our meetings day by day. The Lord has visited Prescott in a special manner and given him a special message for the people. . . . the truth flows forth from him in rich currents.*

*The Lord has sent Prescott; he is no empty vessel, but full of heavenly treasure. He has presented troths in clear and simple style, rich, in nourishment.*

*Prescott’s mind has been fruitful in the troth; may God guide us into all truth. Review and Herald, January 7, 1896.*

With that endorsement let us consider Prescott’s “in Christ” motif.

“Furthermore: every one of us was represented in Jesus Christ when the Word was made flesh and dwelt among us. We were all there in Jesus Christ. We were all represented in Adam after the flesh; and when Christ came as the second Adam, He stepped into the place of the second Adam, and thus we are all represented in Him. He invites us to step into that spiritual family. He has formed this new family, of which He is the Head. He is the new man. In Him we have union with the divine and the human. In the new family every one of us is represented. ‘And as I may so say, Levi also, who receiveth tithes, paid tithes in Abraham. For he was yet in the loins of his father, when Melchisedec met him.’ When Melchisedec went out to meet Abraham returning from the spoil, Abraham paid him a tenth of all. Levi was still in the loins of his father Abraham; but inasmuch as he was a descendant of Abraham, what Abraham did, the Scripture says that Levi did in Abraham. Levi descended from Abraham according to the flesh. He had not been born when Abraham paid tithe; but in that Abraham paid tithe, he paid tithe also. It is exactly so in this spiritual family. What Christ did as Head of this human family, we did in Him. He was our representative; He became flesh; He became we. He did not become simply a man, but He became flesh, and everyone that should be born into His family was represented in Jesus Christ when He lived here in the flesh. You see, then, that all that Christ did, every one who connects himself with this family is given credit for

as doing it in Christ. Christ was not a representative outside him, disconnected from him; but as Levi paid tithe in Abraham, everyone who should afterwards be born into this spiritual family, did what Christ did." Quoted in *The Word Made Flesh*, by Ralph Larson, 95-96.

Prescott recognized that Christ represented all those who would be born into Christ's spiritual family. When advocates of the New View read this statement, they say Prescott is teaching that all men are legally in Christ. They do not see the passages that state, "Everyone that should be born into His family was represented in Jesus Christ. " That is the qualifying understanding of Prescott here and throughout his presentations. When Prescott speaks of "all men" being represented in Christ he believed the "all" were those who are born into that very family. Now let us consider A.T. Jones.

### ***Chapter 10 - A. T. Jones and the "In Christ" Motif***

The first nine sermons of the 26 Jones presented in the 1895 General Conference session pertained to coming out of Babylon. In sermon number ten Jones opens up the theme prevailing through his next 16 sermons. His theme is the "in Christ" motif as related to the first and the second Adam. In sermon number ten he opens the study by asking how we can truly be separated from Babylon, and he then answers, "God has made complete provision for this. That provision is already for our acceptance." Page 175. The context for his following presentation is set as a provision that God has made for people to come out of Babylon.

Sermon 11 presents the concept that Adam and Eve surrendered the mind of Christ for the mind of Satan when they fell. He teaches that the mind of Satan is enmity against God, and that Satan's mind and the enmity were passed upon all men. He also says that the gospel promises to destroy this enmity, and then he states, "We know that this enmity -this mind of self and Satan- separated man from God; but God opened a way for man to return. The Lord gave man a chance to choose which world we will have. And this is the whole subject of our study. . . . It was to give man a chance to choose which world, that the Lord said to Satan, 'I will put enmity' between thee and the seed of the woman. And therefore the only, and everlasting question is which world? Which world? Which world shall a man choose? And when God, in His wondrous mercy, has opened the way, and given us the power to choose a better world than this, why should there be any kind of hesitation?" Page 55.

In sermon 12 he takes up the theme that Christ destroyed the enmity against the law of God when he was incarnated. He took our fallen flesh and destroyed that enmity. He then touches how we to may have this enmity destroyed in us. He states, "If there be those in the audience to whom this seems obscure, and who would say, 'I can not see that;' . . . I would say to such, you will never get it in that way. . . . It is in Him that it is done; not outside of Him. In Him only can it be known, not outside of Him at all. Surrender to Him, yield to Him, sink self with Him, then it will all be plain enough." Page 217, and then on page 218 he states, "No; we are to go to Him for it; there is where it is; and when we go to Him, we are to enter into Him by faith and the Spirit of God, and there remain and ever 'be found in Him.' Philippians 3:9." Now before we proceed farther into this "in Christ" motif let us recognize that sermon 10 speaks of provisions; 11 speaks of our exercising choice; 12 teaches we enter into Him by faith, yielding, and surrendering. The New View teaches we are in Him through no choice of our own. Selah.

In 13 Jones focuses on Christ taking our human nature, and that when He took

human nature-He took our individual human nature-and it is because of this fact He was tempted in all points, and therefore He can give us individually the victory against temptation. He closes with this thought, "This is not to say that we have no more fighting to do. But it is to say, and to say emphatically and joyfully, that in Christ we fight the fight of victory. Out of Christ, we fight, but it is all a defeat. In Him our victory is complete. But, Oh, do not forget the expression: It is in Him." Page 235. At this point you can at least draw one observation. Jones recognized that one could be out of Christ. The New View teaches we are all "in Christ."

In sermon 14 Jones begins to discuss the two Adams in more depth. He speaks about the tendencies to sin that Jesus defeated, and that in Christ we also defeat. Notice what he states about the victory over the flesh, and the provision for that victory. "This is the victory that belongs to the believer in Jesus. It is true that, although a man may have all this in Jesus, he cannot profit by it without himself being a believer in Jesus. Take the man who does not believe in Jesus at all tonight. Has not Christ made all the provision for him that He has for Elijah, who is in heaven tonight? And if this man wants to have Christ for his Saviour, if he wants provision made for all his sins, or to save him from them? No; that is all done; He made all that provision for every man when He was in the flesh, and every man who believes in Him receives it without there being any need of any part of it being done over again." Page 268. On the next page he states: "The first Adam's righteousness would have meant all to us, and the second Adam's righteousness means all to as many as believe." Further on the same page he states: "In Jesus Christ there is furnished in completeness all that man needs or ever can have in righteousness; and all there is for any man to do is to choose Christ, and then it is his." Jones not only taught here, but he also purposely emphasizes that victory comes from being "in Christ" but it is provisional, and only embraced by believers. He teaches that what was done for all men, was a provision that we must choose. To be in Christ, the second Adam, one must choose; believe; and accept the provision. He draws a specific and important parallel when he teaches that Adam's righteousness would have meant everything to all of us, whereas Christ's righteousness means all to "as many as believe."

At this point we suggest that when the New View teaches that the message of AT. Jones was that all men are legally "in Christ" by virtue of being born into humanity, before being born of the Spirit; they are absolutely wresting out of context not only the words of Jones, but also his very themes. To try to avoid this conclusion by stating that at this point Jones was not specifically addressing the first-phase, legal, forensic justification only raises the question as to why he would not at this very point address that very subject if he believed in it. We will now list various lines found in the last 12 sermons and just note the page number.

"And all that the Son asks of any man, in order to accomplish this in him, is that the man will let the Lord have him as the Lord Jesus did." Page 303. We must surrender, to be in Him.

"The battle is fought in the realm of thoughts. . . . And by that means He has brought that divine mind to every man on earth. Therefore, every man for the choosing and by the choosing, can have that divine mind that conquers sin in the flesh. . . . So there is our victory; in Him is our victory; and it is all in having that mind which was in Him." Pages 328-329. We must choose to be in Him.

"And He brings it into my human nature yet, to your human nature at our choice, by the Spirit of God bringing to us His divine presence, and emptying us of ourselves,

and causing God to appear instead of self.” Page 3 31. “Christ emptied Himself, in order that God might be manifest in the flesh, in sinful flesh; and when He comes to us, upon our choice, bringing to us that divine mind of His. . . . Therefore when, by our choice, that divine mind comes to us, the result is certain that ourselves will be emptied as that divine mind dwells in us.” Page 350. “I say it over. I say it is just as much our place, our privilege, and our right, to claim in Christ, in Him only, and as we believe in Him-and to thank God for freedom from the service of sin, as it is to breathe the breath that we breathe as we get up in the morning. How can I ever have the blessing and the benefit there is in the thing if I do not take the thing? If! am always hesitating, and afraid that I am not free from the service of sin. . . . But in Him, when God has wrought for us indeed freedom from the service of sin, we have the right to thank God for it: and as certainly as we claim it, and thank Him for it, we shall enjoy it. ‘He that is dead is freed from sin’ (margin. ‘is justified from sin’). And it is in Him; and we have it in Him by faith.” Page 352. We are in Him by faith, and by choice. “Is Jesus alive? Yes. Thank the Lord! Who died? Jesus died, and we are dead in Him. And He is alive; and we who believe in Him are alive with Him.” Page 353. “That is where God has put us in Christ. So then, as we, along with Him, in the heavenly existence. . . . are made to sit in Christ Jesus, shall we sit there in Him? . . . Is it not plain, then, that Jesus Christ has brought heaven and earth to him who believes?” Page 364. “That purpose from eternity is purposed in Jesus Christ, that purpose embraces us. When we yield to Christ, sinking ourselves in Him, we become part of that eternal purpose.” Page 366. We must yield, to be in Him.

“Read on therefore. ‘Whom He did foreknow, He also did predestinate, . . . them He also called: and whom He called (those in ‘whom that call meets its purpose, and in whom the call is effective. He calls every soul, that is true on His part; but the call does not meet its purpose; only those who respond and meet the purpose of that call, in whom the call takes hold), them also He justified: and whom He justified (mark, not those who justify themselves, those whom He justified), them He also glorified.’” Page 367. The ‘all’ that are justified are only those who respond to the provisions.

“Those who thus accept Christ are looked upon by God not as they are in Adam, but as they are in Jesus Christ, as the sons and daughters of God. He looks at us as we are in Christ; for in Him He has perfected His plan concerning us.” Page 368. We must accept Christ to be in Him.

“We were strangers to the family. We had no connection with the family at all. But the Lord called” and we came; and now He has adopted us into the family.” Pages 396-397. Only those who come are adopted.

“God has been calling from this world unto Himself. . . . God has been calling people from the ranks of Satan. . . . God was calling and receiving those who would turn to Him from the power of Satan.” Pages 447-448. “But nothing but faith in Jesus Christ can make a man righteous; and nothing but that can keep him righteous.” Page 473. Only faith makes one righteous, (justified).

“And if we are not in Jesus Christ, we are not in the third angel’s message. In Jesus Christ the enmity is abolished. . . . until that enmity is abolished by a living faith in Jesus Christ, that surrenders the will to Him, to receive that living, divine image of which we heard in Brother Prescott’s lesson tonight.” Page 474. We must surrender the will to be in Christ Jesus.

“Nothing, nothing, nothing but faith in Jesus Christ, and Him alone nothing but that saves the soul, and nothing but that keeps the soul saved.” Page 475. “But these formalists, not having the salvation of Jesus Christ in themselves by living faith, not

being in Him. . . .” Page 493. Not everyone is “in Him” nor does everyone have salvation, whereas the New View tells us that Jones presented the message that all are unconditionally saved until they reject that salvation.

“He wants us therefore to be so imbued with the life of Jesus Christ itself, and the life of Christ Himself, that the living life of Jesus Christ and the principles of the truth of God shall shine and work in the life, in order that the life of Christ shall still be manifest in human flesh. That is where God has brought us in Him. And we are brought to this place in Him by being by faith ourselves crucified with Him, and dead with Him, and buried with Him.” Page 494.

There is certainly much that we did not address in these sermons, but it should be clear that AT. Jones did not believe that to be “in Christ” was a legal forensic justification that proclaimed an unconditional salvation to all men. Jones’ “in Christ” motif taught that the second Adam provided a way for man-by faith-to claim all the victories that Christ accomplished in His life, through the power of the indwelling Holy Spirit. It was impossible in Jones or Prescott’s presentations to be “in Christ” without Christ being in you. This view is also the teaching of E. J. Waggoner, which we will take up next.

## **Chapter 11 - E.J. Waggoner and the New View**

As we address whether Waggoner’s message sustains the New View we will simply consider some of the basic premises of the New View and see what he says. Does Waggoner believe in the two-phase justification theory? The advocates of the New View state that he does. They refer to statements that he made, ‘that in their mind confirm this view. Let us consider one that they quote often in their material.

“There is no exception here. As the condemnation came upon all, so the justification comes upon all . . . . the free gift comes upon all.” E.J. Waggoner, Signs a/the Times, March 12, 1896.

This quotation is generally left right there. But what is Waggoner trying to convey in his total presentation? Let us add the second paragraph below this statement and see whether Waggoner really believes that all men are justified. Notice the subtitle in bold type with which he begins this paragraph. He must be concluding his thought on this topic here, not in the previous quotation. Consider.

“Why Not All? The text says that ‘by obedience of One shall many be made righteous.’ Someone may ask, ‘Why are not all made righteous by the obedience of One?’ The reason is that they do not wish to be. If men were counted righteous simply because One was righteous eighteen hundred years ago, then all would have to be righteous by the same obedience. There would be no justice in counting righteousness to one and not all, if it were in that way. But we have seen that it is not so.” Ibid.

Waggoner obviously recognized the need of the sinner to choose this righteous, justified experience. That is why he states, “But we have seen that it is not so.” Waggoner is not vague in his understanding of justification. He goes to great lengths to teach that justification is receiving the life of Christ, and it is also receiving Christ’s righteousness. To make Waggoner appear to teach that man can be justified without receiving the life of Christ is to eliminate a large percentage of his articles and sermons, for this was one of his main themes, if not his main theme altogether. Consider the following: .

“Then the free gift is the righteousness of Christ. How do we get the

righteousness of Christ? We cannot separate the righteousness of Christ from Christ Himself. Therefore for men to get the righteousness of Christ, they must have the life of Christ. So the free gift comes upon all men who are justified by the life of Christ. Justification is life. It is the life of Christ. 'For as by one man's disobedience many were made sinners, even so by the obedience of one many shall be made righteous.' These are simple and positive statements. No good can come to a man by questioning them. He only reaps barrenness to his soul. Let us accept them and believe them. 'The free gift came upon all men to justification of life.' Are all men going to be justified? All men might if they would; but says Christ: 'Ye would not come to Me that ye might have life.' All are dead in trespasses and sins. The grace of God that brings salvation has appeared unto all men. It comes right within the reach of all men, and those who do not get it are those that do not want it." Bible Studies on the Book of Romans, page 32.

He is teaching here that all are not justified. If the "most precious message" that Jones and Waggoner brought was the New View's two-phase justification, why did not Jones and Waggoner directly address this thought when they dealt specifically with justification? If this two-phase justification is the message that is to lighten the world with its glory, why did they not specifically address both aspects of this justification when they were addressing justification? "The call is to all. All do not come, all do not take the advice of Peter, and make their calling and election sure; but that is not the fault of God's provision. Now we are 'called' and 'elected.' Sometimes we get wonderfully afraid of that word, 'elected.' Is there any reason to be afraid of that term? No; for every individual can be a candidate, and every candidate can be elected. Here is something that everybody can have, and the fact that one is elected, does not debar everyone else from being elected. In 2 Timothy 1:9 we read, 'Who hath saved us, and called us with a holy calling, not according to our works, but according to His own purpose and grace, which was given us in Christ Jesus before the world began.' Mark you, His own purpose is a purpose of grace, and the free gift of grace comes upon all unto justification of life. Now note what the election is: 'Blessed be the God and Father of our Lord Jesus Christ, who hath blessed us with all spiritual blessings in heavenly places in Christ: According as He hath chosen us in Him before the foundation of the world, that we should be holy and without blame before Him in love. Having predestinated us unto the adoption of children by Jesus Christ to Himself, according to the good pleasure of His will. To the praise and the glory of grace, wherein He hath made us accepted in the beloved.'

'He hath blessed us in all spiritual blessings!' In what?' In Christ; therefore just the moment you give up self and take Christ instead, you have everything that Christ has to give. . . . Everything that is necessary for life and godliness is given unto us. In whom? In Christ . . . and everyone is called to the fellowship of Christ, if he will accept it." Ibid., pages 69-70.

Once again he limits the called to those who accept the calling, not just everyone. Also he addresses what he understands as being "in Christ." And just as do Jones and Prescott, Ellen White, and the Bible, he states that to be "in Christ" you must give up self and take Christ. You can not be "in Christ" without Christ being in you.

"Now God foreknew us in Christ, and in Him in the beginning we were predestined to just such a place in earth in its state of purity as God wants us to have. I am so thankful that we may have Christ if we will, and if we will believe Him and trust Him, we know that we are predestined to a place in His kingdom." Ibid., page 73.

"Those that are justified will be saved, and those that are not justified will be lost, and the only way we can be justified is by the life of Christ. Therefore we preach

justification through Christ's life in Him, and death out of Him." Ibid., page 104.

We have looked at what Waggoner taught in regard to God calling all men, and have noted that he taught that it was only those who respond to the call who receive the free gift. He also taught in the previous quotation that to be "in Christ" is to be justified and saved, and to be out of Christ is to be lost. Does not the New View teach we are all "in Christ"? He taught that we are born into a probationary life and in order to be "in Christ," we must come to Him. Consider the following:

"This probationary life is given for the purpose of giving us a chance to acknowledge Him as Father and to become sons indeed. But unless we come back to Him we shall die as slaves of sin." Glad Tidings, page 90.

How can one take his teachings and say that he taught that we are in Christ unconditionally when he draws such a distinction between the saved and the lost? How?

"This is the same bondage in which all unconverted persons find themselves. . . . 'Everyone who commits sin is a slave to sin.' John 8:34. 'He who commits sin is of the devil.' 1 John 3:8. . . . If a man is not a Christian, he is a heathen; there is no middle ground. If a Christian apostatizes, he becomes a heathen." Ibid., 93. "There is only 'one faith' (verse 5), the faith of Jesus, as there is only one Lord; and those who have not that faith must necessarily be out of Christ." Ibid., 37. .

How do we assign to Waggoner this two-phase justification when confronted with his clear definition of what justification is? How? He states there "is no middle ground." The New View creates a spiritualistic middle ground where even the open sinner is actually saved, without receiving the life of Christ.

"The meaning of the word 'justified' is 'made righteous.' The Latin word for righteousness is *justitia*. To be just is to be righteous. Then we add the termination *fy*, from the Latin word, meaning 'to make,' and we have the exact equivalent of the simple term, 'make righteous.'" Ibid., 40.

Let us close our brief consideration of Waggoner with another classic passage that the New View uses to try to show that Waggoner teaches unconditional salvation.

"All this deliverance is 'according to the will of our God and Father.' The will of God is our sanctification. 1 Thessalonians 4:3. He wills that all men should be saved and come to a knowledge of the truth. 1 Timothy 2:4. And He 'accomplishes all things according to the counsel of His will.' Ephesians 1:11, 'Do you mean to teach universal salvation?' someone may ask. We mean to teach just what the Word of God teaches that 'the grace of God hath appeared, bringing salvation for every man', and has given it to him; but the majority spurn it and throw it away. The judgment will reveal the fact that full salvation was given to every man and that the lost have deliberately thrown away their birthright possession." Ibid., 13-14.

To understand that Waggoner is here saying that every man is saved would contradict several of the previous quotations and many others of his that we have not cited. In the second sentence of the quotation under consideration he says, "that all men should be saved" not that all men are saved. What Waggoner consistently teaches is that grace brings a promise, and that the promise is a reality when accepted by faith.

As we close our consideration of Jones, Prescott, and Waggoner in relation to the New View we must ask some serious questions. The advocates of the New View are quick to imply that if people do not assent to their understanding, they may very well be on the verge of rejecting the same message that was rejected in 1888. This consid-

eration is certainly most sobering.

No one would deny that the experience of justification by faith in the heart of God's people is what has been holding back the latter rain. Certainly, Satan is still actively involved in preventing the final work to move forward. But there are other sobering considerations. Satan succeeded in resisting the "most precious message" a hundred years ago by creating a situation where the true message was rejected by the leadership. Would it be beyond his cunning to attempt to repress the message now by corrupting that "most precious message" within the very group who profess to be proclaiming and upholding that message? The theological perspective contained in this New View is allegedly based on the Bible and the Spirit of Prophecy in connection with the messages of Jones and Waggoner. We must reject the basic conclusions developed by the advocates of the New View as patently incorrect. But at the same time we must insist that in doing so we are not rejecting the message brought by Jones and Waggoner.

At this point we have addressed what seems to be the root of the misunderstandings within the New View, and as we begin to address the book *Beyond Belief* we will examine some of the fruit developed from this root.

View Before we do so, however, let us address another position within the New View that relates to the consistency in reflecting the true 1888 message. If the advocates of the New View believe that they are presenting the message of Jones and Waggoner, should they not be consistent with Jones and Waggoner's themes? We have already demonstrated what we believe to be many glaring inconsistencies, but we will here raise one more issue.

## ***Chapter 12 - The Second Death***

The teaching of the second death is a pivotal understanding to the advocates of the New View. They hold the idea that when the sinner realizes the eternal sacrifice that Jesus gave as He died the second death in man's place, then the sinner's heart is transformed and his motives purified and he develops a heart appreciation for the "matchless charms of Christ." The second death is a pillar of their teaching, and is prevalent in all their materials. We quote here an extract from a paper prepared by Jack Sequeira to demonstrate the significance of this teaching. The paper is designed to present the three views of righteousness by faith within present-day Adventism.

Before we deal with the quotation we add that this paper incorporates a technique found in several of the materials presented by the advocates of the New View. This technique is called *reductio ad absurdum*, and is a technique used by lawyers in a courtroom for the purpose of winning an argument as opposed to seeking truth. It consists of defining your opponents' position in such an inconsistent or exaggerated fashion, that when compared to your position, it would be absurd to accept your opponents' position. We must point out here that of the several papers prepared by those of the 'New View' that define the doctrine of righteousness by faith as understood by what is known as "historic Adventism," none have come close to accurately presenting "historic Adventism's" true understanding of righteousness by faith.

Let us now return to the second death: The following quotation states the emphasis the New View puts on this infinite sacrifice. It is point 'C' in what the author describes as "the essence of this 1888 message." E. H. Sequeira, *How Can We Know the Truth of Righteousness by Faith?* Page 9.

“(c) By equating Christ’s death on the cross with the ‘second death’, ‘good-bye to life forever,’ the 1888 message presented the true nature of Christ’s supreme sacrifice. On the cross He actually submitted to the ‘wages of sin,’ the equivalent of the eternal death, so that we might live in His place. This was the true self-sacrificing glory of God’s love manifested on the cross, which is to have a profound effect on the believer (see *The Desire of Ages*, p. 753). Such love is bound to fill the believer with a hatred of sin itself and not merely a fear of punishment. This New Testament love produced in the heart of the believer becomes the basis of his sanctification. Thus love indeed becomes the fulfillment of the law (Romans 13:8-10; Galatians 5: 13-14; 2 John 6). The justice God’s law demands from sinners is the ‘second death.’ On the cross, Christ tasted death for every man (Hebrews 2:9). Since the Reformation still clung to the immortality of the soul, the ‘wages of sin’ was given a deficient definition, and the cross was robbed of its true glory. It is only when men grasp the true dimension of Christ’s sacrifice on the cross that they will forsake and follow Him with a true faith motive. Such a motive is essential if true sanctification is to be realized; for without genuine faith, holiness of living becomes merely an outward show and not a heart experience.” *Ibid.*, page 10.

There is a certain amount of truth in this last quotation, but there are some minor problems with some of its content. We do not want to address the minor problems at this time, however, as they are minor, and the truth about what happened at the cross is absolutely essential for man to comprehend.

The point that needs to be addressed here is if the message of Jones and Waggoner “equated Christ’s death on the cross with the ‘second death’, ‘good-bye to life forever’ ,” and, “. . .It is only when men grasp the true dimension of Christ’s sacrifice on the cross that they will forsake and follow Him.” It is interesting to note that the Bible never directly says that Jesus died the “second death,” and neither does the Spirit of Prophecy, and neither did Jones and Waggoner. But that is not the point. The point is this: Did the messages of Jones and Waggoner recognize an eternal sacrifice by Jesus that was designed to change the motives of the heart in the individual believer? The answer is Yes.

Let us extract some of these statements from a sermon by Jones in the 1895 General Conference Session. These are from sermon 20. We are going to quote some parts so that you can see that Brother Jones echoes the same sentiments as are stated above by Brother Sequeira. At this point Jones is speaking about the privilege of reflecting the image of God. He asks,

“Shall we accept that privilege? Let us see if we can get some idea of the measure of that privilege. What did it cost to bring that privilege to you and me? What did it cost?- It cost the infinite price of the Son of God.

“Was it an eternal sacrifice? . . .for all eternity? That is the sacrifice that wins the hearts of men. . . . to all eternity -that is a sacrifice. That is the love of God. And no heart can reason against it. There is no heart that can reason against that fact. Whether the heart accepts it or not, whether man believes it or not, there is a subduing power in it, and hearts must stand in silence in the presence of that awful fact. “That is the sacrifice that He made. That is what it cost: The eternal sacrifice of One who was with God. That is what it cost to bring men the privilege to glorify God. “Now another question: Was the privilege there worth the sacrifice? or was the price paid to create the privilege? Please think carefully. What is the privilege? We have found that the privilege brought to every soul is to glorify God. What did it cost to bring that privilege to us? - It cost the infinite sacrifice of the Son of God. Now, did He make the sacrifice to create the privilege, or

was the privilege there and worth the sacrifice? I see that this is a new thought to many of you; but do not be afraid of it. It is all right. Please look at it carefully, and think. That is all that is needed. I will say it over two or three times if necessary; for it is fully worth it. Ever since that blessed fact came to me that the sacrifice of Son of God is an eternal sacrifice, and all for me, the word has been on my mind almost hourly: 'I will go softly before the Lord all my days.' . . .

"Then who can estimate the privilege of glorifying Him? No mind can comprehend it. To be worth the sacrifice that was paid for it -an eternal sacrifice- Oh, did not David do well when he said, looking at these things: 'O Lord, . . . such knowledge is too wonderful for me; it is high, I cannot attain unto it? and, 'In the multitude of my thoughts within me thy comforts delight my soul. '? "We never could have dreamed the privilege was so great. But God looked upon the privilege, Jesus Christ looked upon the privilege, of what it is to glorify God. And looking upon that, and seeing where we had gone, it was said, It is worth the price. Christ said, 'I will give the price.' And 'God so loved the world that He gave His only begotten Son,' and thus brought us the privilege of glorifying God. "

We see that the sacrifice of Christ was absolutely uplifted by Jones also. As the New View lifts up the effects of recognizing that Christ died the second death, Jones lifts up the eternal sacrifice also and says, "That is what wins the hearts of men," and "There is a subduing power in it, and the heart must stand in silence of that awful fact. . . ." What a similarity in presentations! Unfortunately they are not the same presentation, and it is these kinds of misapplications of the message that Jones and Waggoner brought that destroys the credibility of those who profess to echo the message of 1888.

You see, Jones was not talking about the second death. He was not even talking about the cross. He was talking about the infinite sacrifice that Jesus made when He surrendered the omnipresent aspect of His Godhood. According to Jones, the infinite sacrifice that Christ made that is designed to change our hearts was the understanding that Christ was to be encumbered with our humanity forever. And that sacrifice is eternal. It was in reality an eternal sacrifice. He did not just taste humanity, He became humanity forever. Selah!

At this point whether we have or have not demonstrated clearly for the reader the errors and misinterpretations that we see in the New View we hope that we have demonstrated the necessity for each one to study these concepts for himself under the guidance of the Holy Spirit. We cannot let any group, ministry, church, committee, or organization determine what is truth for us individually, no matter what title the group may have. Especially is this fact urgent when it is in connection with such an important message as Christ our Righteousness. We will now briefly address Beyond Belief.

### ***Chapter 13 - Beyond Belief***

On page 7 of Beyond Belief, we are counseled to "put aside all preconceived ideas in order to appreciate its message.

. . . New wine cannot be put into old bottles." Before one puts away his preconceived ideas he should ascertain what kind of wine is being served. After all, there are two kinds of wine ( Matthew 9: 17; and Revelation 18:3).

The advocates of the New View insist that Beyond Belief is the message of 1888,

and therefore we must also ask. Is this new wine the message of Jones and Waggoner, or is it new to their message also? We have to conclude that it is a different wine from the message that Jones and Waggoner brought, but perhaps not so new as many would think. The basic premise of this book may be traced back to the approximate time of Jones and Waggoner, for it was essentially addressed even in that day. Consider a brief passage from a book authored by one of Jones and Waggoner's contemporaries:

"In Jesus Christ the whole world died for its sins, and then in Jesus Christ the whole world arose from the dead with a life that is free from sin. This is the good news which the herald of the cross bears to the world. With the emancipation proclamation, he goes forth proclaiming liberty to all the world. And just as every herald of the President's proclamation of liberty utterly refused to recognize any man as a slave, so the herald of the Gospel must utterly refuse to recognize any man as a slave' of sin. He must proclaim liberty to all men, tell all men that they are free notwithstanding their hereditary or previous condition of servitude."

This passage is of course very similar to page 8 of *Beyond Belief* which states, "I believe the Bible teaches that God actually and unconditionally saved all humanity at the cross so that we are justified and reconciled to God by that act."

That quotation is of course is the position of the New View and the previous quotation is from the book, *The Proclamation of Liberty and the Unpardonable Sin*, by Albion F. Ballenger, published in 1915, page 20. Maybe this new wine is not that new. In any case let us not lay aside all our preconceived ideas when we come to the work of a man; let us test the contents by the "law and the testimony." It is interesting that one of the main themes developed by Ballenger throughout his book is the emancipation proclamation by Abraham Lincoln. This teaching is often used by the advocates of the New View to establish their unconditional salvation, just as Ballenger does. They use the following quotation to demonstrate that Ellen White taught a legal, forensic justification.

*Jesus knows the circumstances of every soul. The greater the sinner's guilt, the more he needs the Saviour. His heart of divine love and sympathy is drawn out most of all for the one who is the most hopelessly entangled in the snares of the enemy. With His own blood He has signed the emancipation papers of the race. The Ministry of Healing, 89-90.*

Does Mrs. White teach that the emancipation proclamation is an illustration of a legal forensic justification for all mankind? Consider the following quotation:.

*When Satan was triumphing as the prince of the world, when he claimed the world as his kingdom, when we were all marred and corrupted with sin, God sent his messenger from heaven, even his only-begotten Son, to proclaim to all the inhabitants of the world: I have found a ransom. I have made a way of escape for all the perishing. I have your emancipation papers provided for you, sealed by the Lord of heaven and earth. You may have freedom upon the condition of faith in Him who is able to save unto the uttermost all who come unto God by Him. A ransom has been provided at infinite cost, and it is not because there is any flaw in the title which has been purchased for lost souls that they do not accept it. It is not because the mercy, the grace, the love of the Father and the Son are not ample, and have not been freely bestowed, that they do not rejoice in pardoning love, but it is because of their unbelief, because of their choice of the world, that they are not comforted with the grace of God. It is their love of disobedience, their pleasure in sin, their enjoyment of rebellion, that have blunted their perceptions until they fail to discern the things which make for their peace. If they are lost, it will be because they will not come unto Christ that they might have life. The Signs*

*of the Times, June 6, 1895.*

Clearly Mrs. White viewed this illustration of Lincoln's emancipation proclamation as a provision with conditions. Whereas the New View, and Ballenger, view it as a legal proclamation that unconditionally saves all men. We have no evidence, other than similarity of content that the New View has been derived from the teachings of Ballenger, and to bring his name into the discussion is what many would call guilt by association. Of course guilt by association, or what is more often called circumstantial evidence, is still evidence nonetheless. Many people have been convicted of a crime by circumstantial evidence alone. But we feel we have already demonstrated enough genuine problems in the New View's interpretations of Jones, Waggoner, and Prescott that we are not just offering circumstantial evidence alone. With that concept in mind, let us address the subject of guilt by association.

### **Guilt by Association**

Let us begin by sharing two quotations. If you are familiar with *Beyond Belief* as we proceed try to remember where in the book they are found.

"When He (Christ) died, legally the 'whole world' died. We were ruined ages before, without our participation by the first Adam. At Calvary, without our personal participation we were redeemed by the second Adam." And also, "The good news declares that all men have been redeemed, that justification has been secured for all, that the whole human race has been restored to favor with God and that all sins . . . are now cancelled for the whole world."

Where do we find these quotations in *Beyond Belief*? We do not. We only find the same theological ideas. The author of these quotations is Desmond Ford. The first is from a paper entitled, *Despite a Million Sermons to the Contrary, the Gospel Is Not Good Advice*, and the second is a Ford statement in *The Theology Crisis*, by Leroy Moore, page 52. This evidence may be circumstantial also, but a fundamental theological position of *Beyond Belief* and Desmond Ford is that at the cross the second Adam actually and unconditionally provided salvation for every man. They may build houses different from each other, but they both have the same foundation. That fact is troubling, if only circumstantial.

Adventism's New View More circumstantial evidence is Sequeira's dependence on Calvinistic theologians, men like Thomas F. Torrence, Anders Nygren, John Murray, and C.E.B. Cranfield. When you research these men's works, you find they often cross-referenced one another; that their work focused on ecumenicalism; that they were Calvinists in their theology; and one of the prevalent themes was agape and Eros love. We have looked at circumstantial evidence which some would call guilt by association. Let us consider now what might be called guilt by unassociation.

### **Guilt by Unassociation**

Although *Beyond Belief* uses many Adventist terms, its supporters state that the reason it lacks in Spirit of Prophecy references is that it was designed as an outreach book. There is only one quotation from Ellen White in the book, but what adds to the interest of this observation is that the propagators of the New View have handout materials encouraging people to investigate the New View by the Bible, and the Bible alone. They of course use Spirit of Prophecy quotations to establish this tenet, and we agree that the Bible is the foundation of all truth, but we also remember statements, as in

Maranatha, page 158:

*The very last deception of Satan will be to make of none effect the testimony of the Spirit of God. "Where there is no vision the people perish" (Proverbs 29: 18). Satan will work ingeniously, in different ways and through different agencies, to unsettle the confidence of God's remnant people in the true testimony."*

The New View advocates include in their handout material papers designed to downplay the use of the writings of the Spirit of Prophecy. A sampling of two quotations from one of their papers entitled E.G. White's Counsel on the Use of Her Writings With Respect to the Bible, states:

*Don't quote Sister White. I don't want you to ever quote Sister White until you get your vantage ground where you know where you are. Quote the Bible. Talk the Bible. It's full of meat, full of fatness. Carry it right out in your life, and you will know more Bible than you know now. Spalding-Magan Collection, 174.*

*Believers are nor to rest in suppositions and ill-defined ideas of what constitutes truth. Their faith must be firmly founded upon the Word of God. Testimonies, vol. 5, 708.*

These papers that the New View advocates print strangely leave out several other quotations on the subject of the use of the Spirit of Prophecy. Consider the following as a brief example:

*Besides the instruction in His Word, the Lord has given special testimonies to His people, not as new revelation, but that He may set before us the plain lessons of His Word, that errors may be corrected, that the right way may be pointed out, that every soul may be without excuse. Selected Messages, book 3,31.*

*The Bible must be your counselor. Study it and the testimonies God has given; for they never contradict His Word. Ibid., 32.*

*The Testimonies God has given His people are in harmony with His Word. Testimonies to Ministers, 292.*

The problem of the Bible only is twofold. One is the preponderance of information in the Spirit of Prophecy on the subject of justification. How can one avoid it? It is curious to note that virtually none of the information on justification in the Spirit of Prophecy can be bent to fit into the New View's concept of a two-phase justification. The second problem with the Bible alone is the willingness to use Jones, Waggoner, and Prescott, but not Ellen White. Of course the writings of Jones, Waggoner, and Prescott do not support the New View either, but unfortunately their writings are not as well known, nor as easily available, as the Spirit of Prophecy, and therefore they can be more easily presented in a false light.

Two meetings were held in 1994 between Jack Sequeira and some prominent members of the 1888 Message Study Committee, and a few other ministries not in agreement with the theology contained in the book Beyond Belief The first meeting was for a day in January; then the second meeting was two days in February. Both meetings were at Loma Linda, California. .

At the close of the first day of the second meeting, a motion was made that on the following day Colin Standish do an exegesis on Romans 7 to be followed by exegesis on Romans 7 by Jack Sequeira. The motion was passed and the next day there came a change of the agenda. The New View advocates wanted Romans 5 to be addressed instead of Romans 7, with one interesting addition. They made a motion that in the exegesis no Spirit of Prophecy could be used. Of course, there followed a lively

discussion on light and truth, but the numbers were there for the New View. No Spirit of Prophecy was allowed to be introduced in the exegesis on Romans 5. One must ask himself why? The obvious answer to this writer is that Romans 5: 18 is too important a verse for the advocates of the New View to be challenged by the clear testimony of the Spirit of Prophecy. If the New View is to be accepted, Romans 5: 18 must teach that all men are justified.

*The atonement that has been made for us by Christ is wholly and abundantly satisfactory to the Father. God can be just, and yet the justifier of those who believe. Here the truth is laid out in plain lines. This mercy and goodness is wholly undeserved. The grace of Christ is freely to justify the sinner without merit or claim on his part. Justification is a full, complete pardon of sin. The moment a sinner accepts Christ by faith, that moment he is pardoned. The righteousness of Christ is imputed to him, and he is no more to doubt God's forgiving grace. There is nothing in faith that makes it our saviour. Faith cannot remove our guilt. Christ is the power of God unto salvation to all them that believe. The justification comes through the merits of Jesus Christ. He has paid the price for the sinner's redemption. Yet it is only through faith in His blood that Jesus can justify the believer. The Seventh-day Adventist Bible Commentary, 1071.*

*But while God can be just, and yet justify the sinner through the merits of Christ, no man can cover his soul with the garments of Christ's righteousness while practicing known sins, or neglecting known duties. God requires the entire surrender of the heart, before justification can take place; and in order for man to retain justification, there must be continual obedience, through active, living faith that works by love and purifies the soul. Selected Messages, book 1, 366.*

It is just impossible to make Ellen White teach that men are justified while yet in their sins. If she did so, of course the advocates of the New View would shout these passages from the rooftops. Instead they vote to silence her on the subject of justification.

*Christ did not come to excuse sin, nor to justify a sinner while he continued to transgress that law for which the Son of God was to give his life to vindicate and exalt. Had it been possible for the law to be repealed, Christ would have had no need to come to our earth, and to die, the just for the unjust. God could have taken the sinner back into favor by annulling the law. But this could not be. The law holds the transgressor in bondage, but the obedient are free. The law cannot cleanse from sin, it condemns the sinner. The sinner may stand justified before God only through repentance toward Him, and faith in the merits of Jesus Christ. Signs of the Times, July 18, 1878.*

At this point we will address a few more of the theological aberrations in Beyond Belief We will not plumb the depths of each issue, but will simply demonstrate them to be in opposition to truth. Many articles have been published recently that deal with this book, and the theological positions it presents. Also a video round-table discussion featuring Ron Spear, Colin Standish, and Ralph Larson can be obtained from Hope International, specifically addressing these issues in depth. The title of this video presentation is Absolutely Beyond Belief We recommend to the reader these sources, if a broader presentation is needed.

## **Chapter 14 - Other Problems**

### **Rejection of the Substitutionary Atonement of Christ**

From pages 39-47 of *Beyond Belief* the substitutionary atonement is rejected on the authority of Catholic theologians. Sequeira states, "As the Catholic theologians pointed out, it is a fundamental principle of all law, God's or man's, that guilt or punishment cannot be transferred from the guilty to the innocent, nor can the righteousness of one person be legally transferred to another." *Beyond Belief*, 42. Let us consider a few verses that stand against the New View and the Catholic theologians.

*But God commendeth His love toward us, in that, while we were yet sinners, Christ died for us. Romans 5:8. See also Matthew 20:28, 26:28; Romans 3:25, 5:6,8, 14:15; 1 Corinthians 5:7, 15:3; 2 Corinthians 5:15; Ephesians 5:2; 1 Thessalonians 5:10; Hebrews 10:12, 1 Peter 3: 18.*

These verses present the transfer of the penalty; now consider the transfer of righteousness.

*Even the righteousness of God [which is] by faith of Jesus Christ unto all them that believe; for there is no difference. Romans 3:22. See also Romans 4:6, 5:17; Philippians 3:9; Hebrews 11:7.*

If one desires to see both punishment and righteousness transferred in one passage, consider Isaiah 53. The New View and Sequeira take the corporate idea to an extreme that denies the biblical transfer effected at and by the cross.

*The Lord imputes unto the believer the righteousness of Christ and pronounces him righteous before the universe. He transfers the sins to Jesus, the sinner's Representative, Substitute, and Surety. Upon Christ He lays the iniquity of every soul that believeth. "He hath made Him to be sin for us, who knew no sin, that we might be made the righteousness of God in Him." 2 Corinthians 5:21. Selected Messages, book 1, 392.*

### **Other Problems**

#### **Universalist Language**

As opposed to the true messengers of 1888 (Jones and Waggoner), the New View sees all men as in Christ. *Beyond Belief* presents the New View's universalists language also. Consider the following:

"God has legally justified all mankind in Christ." Page 34. "First, salvation is what God has already accomplished for all mankind in the life and death of Jesus," Page 31, "God has legally justified all mankind in Christ," Page 34, "All humanity was in Christ." Page 35, "The apostle Paul describes the salvation God has already accomplished for all humanity in the finished work of Christ as 'you in Christ' ," Page 36, "Likewise, the Bible teaches that God has redeemed all humanity in one man, Jesus Christ." Page 37. "The entire human race is corporately one 'in Jesus Christ'," Page 37, "What Jesus did, we have done, because we are corporately one in Him." Page 37. "As the second Adam, Christ gathered to Himself the whole human race and died the second, eternal death-the wages of sin." Page 86,

There is more of this universalist teaching in *Beyond Belief*, but this sampling

should be enough to establish its position, Contrary to Jones, Waggoner, and Prescott, the New View's corporate understanding does not include the truth that to be part of the second Adam's family, the divine-human family as Prescott called it, one must be born again by receiving the provisions of the gospel. There are deeper ramifications to these errant positions, but we are limited here by space and time,

## Calvinistic Language

At the meetings in Lorna Linda in February 1994, one of the proponents stated that he did not want to get bogged down in "babyology." To understand why he did not want the discussion to go that direction, consider the following quotations from Beyond Belief in terms of what happens when an infant dies.

"All mankind stands legally condemned because all sinned in one man, Adam," Page 40, "Since all of us sinned in Adam," Page 85, "Sinful man is not lost because he has committed sins, but because he is without Christ—that is, because he is born of Adam, and therefore stands condemned in him even before he commits a sin of his own." Page 134.

These of course are not all of the Calvinistic references found in Beyond Belief, but they demonstrate where building on a false premise leads.

## Contradictions to Inspiration

We will share a few of the contradictions found in Beyond Belief. "God had not yet explicitly spelled out His law until He gave it to mankind as a legal code through Moses." Beyond Belief, 53.

*Adam and Eve, at their creation, had a knowledge of the law of God; they were acquainted with its claims upon them; its precepts were written upon their hearts. . . . Adam taught his descendants the law of God, and it was handed down from father to son through successive generations. . . . The law was preserved by Noah and His family, and Noah taught his descendants the Ten Commandments. Patriarchs and Prophets, 363.*

"A sinful nature, they remind us, is itself sin." Beyond Belief, 43. If the sinful nature is sin itself, did Christ take our nature?

*In Him was no guile nor sinfulness. . . yet He took upon Him our sinful nature. Signs of the Times, July 30, 1902.*

"The sinful nature is beyond repair; it cannot be rebuilt into something acceptable to God" Beyond Belief, 131.

*The forgiveness of sins is not the sole result of the death of Jesus. He made the infinite sacrifice, not only that sin might be removed, but the human nature might be restored, rebeautified, reconstructed from its ruins, and made fit for the presence of God. Testimonies, vol. 5, 537.*

"The Reformers, nevertheless, were ethically wrong in their definition of substitution—that the doing and dying of Christ was accepted instead of our doing and dying." Beyond Belief, 40.

*In dying upon the cross, He transferred the guilt from the person of the transgressor to that of the divine Substitute, through faith in Him as a personal Redeemer. The sins of a guilty world, which in figure are represented as 'red as*

*crimson, were imputed to the divine Surety. The Seventh-day Adventist Bible Commentary, vol. 7, 462.*

“Christ’s flesh, being our corporate sinful flesh, lusted after sin.” Beyond Belief, 147.

Prayerfully consider the ramifications of that last statement in the light of James’ statement about lust.

*Then when lust hath conceived, it bringeth forth sin: and sin, when it is finished, bringeth forth death. James 1:15.*

*The flesh itself cannot act contrary to the will of God. The Adventist Home, 127.*

## **Imputed and Imparted Righteousness**

The New View advocates separate justification and sanctification to the point that they teach that we are saved totally by justification and that sanctification is simply the fruit of that saved condition. Sequeira states their position clearly in this next quotation.

“We often describe the first aspect of salvation -the objective gospel- as the imputed righteousness of Christ. This is what qualifies the believer for heaven, both now and in the judgment. We describe the second aspect of salvation -the subjective gospel- as the imparted righteousness of Christ. This is what gives evidence of the reality of the imputed righteousness of Christ in the life. It does not contribute in the slightest way to our qualification to heaven; it witnesses, or demonstrates, what is already true in Christ. Imparted righteousness does not qualify us for heaven” Beyond Belief, 32.

*The righteousness by which we are justified is imputed; the righteousness by which we are sanctified is imparted. The first is our title to heaven, the second is our fitness for heaven. The Faith I Live By, 116.*

The New View teaches that sanctification does not “qualify us for heaven,” but the Spirit of Prophecy states that it is our fitness for heaven. Consider what the two words mean. fit: adapted to an end or purpose; becoming; suitable; qualified. -ness n. the state of being fit. Webster’s, underlining supplied. qualify: . . .to show oneself fit. Ibid.

“The righteousness God produces in us, on the other hand, has no saving value.” Beyond Belief, 170.

*Not by works of righteousness which we have done, but according to His mercy He saved us, by the washing of regeneration, and renewing of the Holy Ghost. Titus 3:5.*

*But we are bound to give thanks alway to God for you, brethren beloved of the Lord, because God hath from the beginning chosen you to salvation through sanctification of the spirit and belief of the truth. 2 Thessalonians 2:13.*

## **Works**

We will not go in depth into the position of the New View on man’s efforts in the plan of salvation. We will let Sequeira state his case, and then follow with a few quotations from the Spirit of Prophecy.

“If a person does not believe that a full and complete salvation has already been obtained in Jesus Christ, if a person believes that salvation ultimately depends to some degree on his or her behavior, then the faith such a person is able to generate will naturally be polluted with self-concern.” Beyond Belief, 91.

*The man who attempts to keep the commandments of God from a sense of obligation merely-because he is required to do so-will never enter into the joy of obedience. He does not obey. When the requirements of God are accounted a burden because they cut across human inclination, we may know that the life is not a Christian life. True obedience is the outworking of a principle within. It springs from the love of righteousness, the love of the law of God. The essence of all righteousness is loyalty to our Redeemer. This will lead us to do right because it is right-because right doing is pleasing to God. Christ's Object Lessons, 97-98.*

*None are living Christians unless they have a daily experience in the things of God and daily practice self-denial, cheerfully bearing the cross and following Christ. Every living Christian will advance daily in the divine life. As he advances toward perfection, he experiences a conversion to God every day; and this conversion is not completed until he attains to perfection of Christian character, a full preparation for the finishing touch of immortality. Testimonies, vol. 2, 505.*

*When He comes He is not to cleanse us of our sins, to remove from us the defects in our character, or to cure us of the infirmities of our tempers and dispositions. If wrought for us at all, this work will all be accomplished before that time. When the Lord comes, those who are holy will be holy still. Those who have preserved their bodies and spirits in holiness, in sanctification and honor, will then receive the finishing touch of immortality. But those who are unjust, unsanctified, and filthy, will remain so forever. No work will then be done for them to remove their defects, and give them holy characters. The Refiner does not then sit to pursue His refining process and remove their sins and their corruption. This is all to be done in these hours of probation. It is now that this work is to be accomplished for us. Counsels on Health, 44.*

The New View states we must view the work of salvation in the past tense, a finished work. Mrs. White says we must have it accomplished for us now. These are by no means all the problems contained in the book *Beyond Belief*, or in the teachings of the 1888 Message Study Committee. But they should be enough to raise a warning flag to the serious student. We repeat our opening quotation:

*We must know individually the prescribed conditions of entering into eternal life. . . We cannot allow these questions to be settled for US by another's mind, or another's judgment. We must search the Scriptures carefully with a heart open to the reception of light and the evidences of truth. We cannot trust the salvation of our souls to ministers, to idle traditions, to human authorities, or to pretensions. We must know for ourselves what God has said. . . . It is not to be our study as to what may be the opinion of men, or of popular faith, or what the Fathers have said. We cannot trust to the voice of the multitude, but we want to know what is the voice of God, what is his revealed will. . . . The Lord positively demands of every Christian an intelligent knowledge of the Scriptures. Review and Herald, March 3, 1887.*

## **APPENDIX**

By Colin Standish

The Word of God demonstrates that the gospel of salvation encompasses both justification by faith and sanctification by faith. Christ and the Bible writers presented a gospel which denied the Reformational claim that the gospel was justification alone. We will now look at the claims of the objective gospel which is a central feature of the 1888

Study Group's teaching and of Elder Jack Sequeira's book, *Beyond Belief* This latter fact is made clear in the preface to Elder Sequeira's book:

"For four hundred years, Protestant Christianity has been divided into two camps regarding salvation. The first, Calvinism, confesses that Christ actually saved human beings on the cross, but that this salvation is limited only to the elect—those whom God has predetermined to be saved. The second view, Arminianism [the concepts of the Dutch reformer, Arminius, who strongly opposed Calvin's concepts of predestination and once saved, always saved], holds that on the cross Christ obtained salvation for all humanity, but that this salvation is only a provision; a person must believe and repent for the provision to become a reality. Both these views are only conditional good news.

"I believe that neither camp presents the full truth about salvation. I believe the Bible teaches that God actually and unconditionally saved all humanity at the cross so that we are justified and reconciled by God by that act (see Romans 5:10, 18; 2 Corinthians 5: 18-9). I believe that the only reason anyone will be lost is because he or she willfully and persistently rejects God's gift of salvation in Christ (see John 3:18,36). This is what constitutes the three angels' messages of Revelation 14, the everlasting gospel that must be preached to every nation, kindred, tongue, and people before the end comes." Jack Sequeira, *Beyond Belief*, 7-8.

This opening statement should have raised a red flag right at the beginning for anyone who read it. That so many have accepted this amazing introduction, among them many who had no difficulty rejecting the presentations of Dr. Ford a decade or two ago, is remarkable. Let us briefly examine the three emphasized portions of this statement in the light of divine revelation.

1. To deny that we must believe and repent to attain salvation denies the very gospel preached by Jesus.

*Now after that John was put in prison, Jesus came into Galilee, preaching the gospel of the kingdom of God, and saying, The time is fulfilled, and the kingdom of God is at hand: repent ye, and believe the gospel. Mark 1:14-15.*

*For God so loved the world, that he gave his only begotten Son, that whosoever believeth in him should not perish, but have everlasting life. John 3:16.*

*I tell you, Nay: but, except ye repent, ye shall all likewise perish. Luke 13:3.*

2. The claim that salvation is unconditional is just as devoid of scriptural foundation as is the claim that salvation does not require belief or repentance.

*There are conditions to our receiving justification and sanctification, and the righteousness of Christ. Selected Messages, vol. 1, 377.*

*Blessed is the man that endureth temptation: for when he is tried, he shall receive the crown of life, which the Lord hath promised to them that love him. James 1:12.*

*Hearken, my beloved brethren, Hath not God chosen the poor of this world rich in faith, and heirs of the kingdom which he hath promised to them that love him? James 2:5.*

*But as it is written, Eye hath not seen, nor ear heard, neither have entered into the heart of man, the things which God hath prepared for them that love him. 1 Corinthians 2:9.*

*For since the beginning of the world men have not heard, nor perceived by the*

*ear, neither hath the eye seen, O God, beside thee, what he hath prepared for him that waiteth for him. Isaiah 64:4.*

*Like as a father pitieth his children, so the Lord pitieth them that fear him. Psalm 103: 13.*

*But if we walk in the light, as he is in the light, we have fellowship one with another, and the blood of Jesus Christ his Son cleanseth us from all sin. I John 1:7.*

*And shewing mercy unto thousands of them that love me, and keep my commandments. Exodus 20:6.*

*Blessed are they that do his commandments, that they may have right to the tree of life, and may enter in through the gates into the city. Revelation 22:14.*

3. The third concept is just as erroneous. While rejection will lead to eternal loss, so will neglect.

*How shall we escape, if we neglect so great salvation; which at the first began to be spoken by the Lord, and was confirmed unto us by them that heard him? Hebrews 2:3.*

*The concept that we are saved unless we reject or resist is extraordinarily dangerous. It indicates that if we make no decision we will be saved. In reality we must accept Christ's saving grace, or we will be lost. We must choose to be for Christ.*

*He that is not with me is against me; and he that gathereth not with me scattereth abroad. Matthew 12:30.*

On the issue of righteousness by faith there are few substantial differences between the message of Elder Jack Sequeira and the message of Dr. Desmond Ford.

Like Desmond Ford, Jack Sequeira believes:

1. The gospel is justification alone. "Justification means all of Christ's righteousness that He provided for us so that nothing more is required of us to qualify for heaven. In other words, we stand perfect in Him." *Beyond Belief*, 103. Emphasis in the original.

2. There is an objective gospel. "The objective gospel (the imputed righteousness of Christ) is what qualifies us for heaven both now and in the judgment." *Ibid.*, 36. However, unlike Desmond Ford, Jack Sequeira also believes in justification by faith.

3. That sanctification is a very part of truth, but it does not contribute to our qualification for heaven. "The subjective gospel (the imparted righteousness of Christ) does not contribute to our qualification for heaven; it gives evidence of the reality of Christ's imputed righteousness in the life." *Ibid.*

4, The centrality of the gospel is the "in Christ" motif. "The central theme of the apostle Paul's theology regarding the gospel is the 'in Christ' motif or idea." *Ibid.*, 33.

5. All of our salvation was accomplished 2000 years ago on Calvary logically making the sanctuary ministry of Christ redundant in spite of the fact that both Ford and Sequeira speak much about the sanctuary message. "All three of these aspects of our salvation-justification, sanctification, and glorification-have already been accomplished in the birth, life, death, and resurrection of our Lord Jesus Christ." *Ibid.*, 30.

6. Both teach a universal salvation. "I believe the Bible teaches that God actually and unconditionally saved all humanity at the cross so that we are justified and

reconciled to God by that act.” Ibid., 8.

7. We can only lose salvation by active and persistent rejection of salvation. “I believe that the only reason anyone will be lost is because he or she willfully and persistently rejects God’s gift of salvation in Christ.” Ibid.

8. If we sin we still retain justification. “However, God does not reject us every time we make a mistake or fall into sin. If we believe that we lose our justification in Christ each time we sin, we completely invalidate the truth of justification by faith.” Ibid., 104.

Both teach many concepts common to Evangelical Protestantism, Calvinism, and Augustinian Catholicism. This position does not allow for a true Seventh-day Adventist position on the sanctuary message despite the fact that Elder Sequeira has done a lengthy series on this message. The book *Beyond Belief* significantly ignores the heavenly sanctuary message as part of the salvational acts of God; therefore one assumes that Elder Sequeira believes that the atonement was completed on the cross, rather than in the heavenly sanctuary as clearly identified in the type.

*And there shall be no man in the tabernacle of the congregation when he goeth in to make an atonement in the [most] holy place, until he: come out, and have made an atonement for himself, and for his household, and for all the congregation of Israel. Leviticus 16: 17.*

Sister White says that the sanctuary message is the center of our faith.

*The correct understanding of the ministration in the heavenly sanctuary is the foundation of our faith. Evangelism, 221.*

Some have challenged this concept, saying that the cross is the center of our faith, but, of course, the cross of Christ, His death and sacrifice, are integral to the sanctuary message. Without the sacrifice, there would be no administration of the blood before the mercy seat by the heavenly high priest.

Concerning the objective gospel, Elder Sequeira further says: “This salvation is an objective truth realized in the earthly history of Christ, and therefore we can refer to it theologically as the objective gospel.” *Beyond Belief*, p. 31..

While he does acknowledge a subjective aspect of the gospel, Sequeira denies that it has anything to add to the objective gospel. “Second, Scripture also refers to salvation as what God accomplishes in us through the Holy Spirit. This aspect of salvation is not something in addition to the objective facts of the gospel.” Ibid. The claims to an objective justification are built around Romans 5:18.

*Therefore as by the offence of one judgment came upon all men to condemnation; even so by the righteousness of one the free gift came upon all men unto justification of life. Romans 5: 18.*

It is argued that all humanity, past, present, and future, were justified on Calvary. This belief is a strong pillar of the 1888 Study Committee, yet it is not to be found in the message of the book *Christ Our Righteousness*, by W. Waggoner nor is it to be found in a broad study of the Word of God. Sister White, in the thousands of pages she wrote on the 1888 message of *Christ Our Righteousness*, never once distinguishes between an objective and a subjective form of justification.

It is not uncommon for those who support the 1888 Study Committee to say that there are two phases of justification: forensic (legal, universal, corporate, temporary,

judicial) justification, which is a justification which came upon all men through the death of Jesus Christ; and justification by faith.

Unlike Dr. Ford's presentations, there is an emphasis on justification by faith, but, as pointed out in the October 1993 issue of *Our Firm Foundation*, vol. 8, no. 10, we have seen that the forensic justification concept has no foundation in the Bible or in the Spirit of Prophecy. We also noted that in the end this concept begins to dominate over the only justification that will ever save us, and that is justification by faith. This teaching leaves US in danger of moving God's people towards a concept in which obedience is seen to have less and less importance in the development of a people of God who will be fit for the kingdom of heaven. The Bible is rich with statements showing that the subjective transformation of the life is absolutely essential in those who will be saved.

*Now unto him that is able to keep you from falling, and to present you faultless before the presence of his glory with exceeding joy. Jude 24.*

*He that hath an ear, let him hear what the Spirit saith unto the churches; To him that overcometh will I give to eat of the tree of life, which is in the midst of the paradise of God. Revelation 2:7.*

*He that hath an ear, let him hear what the Spirit saith unto the churches; He that overcometh shall not be hurt of the second death. Revelation 2: 11.*

*He that hath an ear, let him hear what the Spirit saith unto the churches; To him that overcometh will I give to eat of the hidden manna, and will give him a white stone, and in the stone a new name written, which no man knoweth saving he that receiveth it. Revelation 2: 17.*

*He that overcometh, the same shall be clothed in white raiment; and I will not blot out his name but of the book of life, but I will confess his name before my Father, and before his angels. Revelation 3:5.*

*Him that overcometh will I make a pillar in the temple of my God, and he shall go no more out: and I will write upon him the name of my God, and the name of the city of my God, which is new Jerusalem, which cometh down out of heaven from my God: and I will write upon him my new name. Revelation 3: 12.*

*To him that overcometh will I grant to sit with me in my throne, even as I also overcame, and am set down with my Father in his throne. Revelation 3:21.*

*If ye abide in me, and my words abide in you, ye shall ask what ye will, and it shall be done unto you. John 15:7.*

*And the very God of peace sanctify you wholly; and I pray God your whole spirit and soul and body be preserved blameless unto the coming of our Lord Jesus Christ. 1 Thessalonians 5:23.*

*And now, brethren, I commend you to God, and to the word of his grace, which is able to build you up, and to give you an inheritance among all them which are sanctified. Acts 20:32.*

The picture is clear. Is the vine in the branch, or the branch in the vine? Obviously they are in each other. There is no such thing as an "in Christ" motif outside of a "Christ in" motif, the two cohere together in the gospel.

In his first epistle, John continues to emphasize the unity of the "in Christ" and the "Christ in" message.

One of the most important pillars of the objective gospel is the “in Christ” motif. As Elder Sequeira says: “The central theme of the apostle Paul’s theology regarding the gospel is the ‘in Christ’ motif or idea.” Ibid. 33. He sees this as his fundamental concept of “corporate oneness.” The idea is that we were all “in Christ” when He died on Calvary, when He paid the penalty for our sins.

While Elder Sequeira also refers to the “Christ in,” motif it is clear that, like his reference to sanctification, he does not see it as essential to the salvation of mankind. But let us look at the foundation of this message. Christ Himself refused to separate the two components; they are as indivisibly linked as are justification and sanctification.

*And he that keepeth his commandments dwelleth in him, and he in him. And hereby we know that he abideth in us, by the Spirit which he hath given us. 1 John 3:24.*

*Hereby know we that we dwell in him, and he in us, Because he hath given us of his Spirit. And we have seen and do testify that the Father sent the Son to be the Saviour of the world. Whosoever shall confess that Jesus is the Son of God, God dwelleth in him, and he in God. And we have known and believed the love that God hath to us. God is love; and he that dwelleth in love dwelleth in God, and God in him. 1 John 4:13-16.*

That Paul fully acknowledged the “Christ in” and the “in Christ” concept can be seen from some of the following texts:

*He that eateth my flesh, and drinketh my blood, dwelleth in me, and I in him. John 6:56.*

*I am crucified with Christ: nevertheless I live; yet not I, but Christ liveth in me; and the life which I now live in the flesh I live by the faith of the Son of God, who loved me, and gave himself for me. Galatians 2:20.*

*At that day ye shall know that I am in my Father, and ye in me, and I in you. John 14:20.*

*But ye are not in the flesh, but in the Spirit, if so be that the Spirit of God dwell in you. Now if any man have not the Spirit of Christ, he is none of his. And if Christ be in you, the body is dead because of sin; but the Spirit is life because of righteousness. Romans 8:9-10.*

*I in them, and thou in me, that they may be made perfect in one; and that the world may know that thou hast sent me, and hast loved them, as thou hast loved me. John 17:23.*

*To whom God would make known what is the riches of the glory of this mystery among the Gentiles; which is Christ in you, the hope of glory. Colossians 1:27.*

*Perhaps the unity of the two is best seen in Jesus’ use of the vine and branch illustration of John 15.*

*Abide in me, and I in you. As the branch cannot bear fruit of itself, except it abide in the vine; no more can ye, except ye abide in me. John 15:4.*

There is no objective gospel separate from the subjective gospel. Any legal acts of God reflect what has happened and is happening in the life of the man. Everything that is done reflects what is taking place in the life of the Christian. When we are justified in heaven, it is because we have repented and confessed our sins, and we have new motives, new impulses, new desires, a new character. When we are sanctified in heaven it is because Christ is dwelling daily in our hearts. When our sins are blotted out in the

investigative judgment, they are not only blotted out of the books of record in heaven, they are also blotted out of the lives of God's people.

*As in the final atonement the sins of the truly penitent are to be blotted from the records of heaven, no more to be remembered or come into mind, so in the type they were borne away into the wilderness, forever separated from the congregation. Patriarchs and Prophets, 358.*

*The righteous will not cease their earnest agonizing cries for deliverance. They cannot bring to mind any particular sin, but in their whole life they can see but little good. Their sins have gone before hand to judgment, and pardon has been written. Their sins have been borne away into the land of forgetfulness, and they could not bring them to remembrance. Spiritual Gifts, vol. 3, 135.*

*But while they [the saints after the close of probation] have a deep sense of their unworthiness, they have no concealed wrongs to reveal. Their sins have gone beforehand to judgment and have been blotted out, and they cannot bring them to remembrance. The Great Controversy, 620.*

With great joy we can acknowledge that Inspiration presents a gospel that transforms the life and fits men and women for the courts of heaven. Thus we have to reject Elder Sequeira's statement:

"Performing works of law is a subtle form of rebellion against God because all such works are actually independent of Him." Beyond Belief, 97.

It is true that the works of the law cannot save us but it is not true to say that the works of the law by faith is a subtle form of rebellion.

*Knowing that a man is not justified by the works of the law, but by the faith of Jesus Christ, even we have believed in Jesus Christ, that we might be justified by the faith of Christ, and not by the works of the law: for by the works of the law shall no flesh be justified. Galatians 2:16.*

It is works of the law through the flesh which are rebellion against God.

*Now the works of the flesh are manifest, which are these; adultery, fornication, uncleanness, lasciviousness, idolatry, witchcraft, hatred, variance, emulations, wrath, strife, seditions, heresies, envyings, murders, drunkenness, revellings, and such like: of the which I tell you before, as I have also told you in time past, that they which do such things shall not inherit the kingdom of God. Galatians 5: 19-21.*

While Elder Sequeira and the members of the 1888 Message Study Committee do speak about sanctification, the logic of their position leads many thinking men and women to conclude that perfection of character is not essential to salvation. Yet Inspiration says:

*And the dragon was wroth with the woman, and went to make war with the remnant of her seed, which keep the commandments of God, and have the testimony of Jesus Christ. Revelation 12:17.'*

*Here is the patience of the saints: here are they that keep the commandments of God, and the faith of Jesus. Revelation 14:12.*

*Blessed are they that do his commandments, that they may have right to the tree of life, and may enter in through the gates into the city. Revelation 22:14.*

*"When the fruit is brought forth, immediately he putteth in the sickle, because the*

*harvest is come." Christ is waiting with longing desire for the manifestation of Himself in His church. When the character of Christ shall be perfectly reproduced in His people, then He will come to claim them as His own. Christ's Object Lessons, 69.*

Acceptance of the objective gospel concept will inevitably lead many to conclude that they can be saved short of perfect obedience, the obedience that comes through the power of the indwelling Christ, and in response to their love for the gift of our heavenly Father. If we doubt this assertion we have only to review the carnage caused by Dr. Ford's teachings.

In summary, it can be said without doubt that the objective gospel is a figment of human imagination which has arisen out of Augustinian Catholicism, and which ultimately leads people away from the transforming power of Christ in the life and from their preparation to be fit or qualified to walk the streets of gold with the unfallen beings of heaven.

FOOTNOTE: The objective gospel is a purported method of justifying man without his knowledge or participation and thus regardless of any internal change or transformation-sanctification. See *Beyond Belief*, 31-33.